

L. Steven Platt  
Cathy Ventrell-Monsees

---

# Age Discrimination Litigation

---

Volume 1



Contact us at (800) 440-4780 or [www.jamespublishing.com](http://www.jamespublishing.com)

(Rev. 12, 5/12)

## AGE DISCRIMINATION LITIGATION

---

Copyright © 2012 James Publishing, Inc.

ISBN 1-58012-058-X

This publication is intended to provide accurate and authoritative information about the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher does not render legal or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, seek the services of a competent professional.

Persons using this publication in dealing with specific legal matters should exercise their own independent judgment and research original sources of authority and local court rules.

The publisher and the authors make no representations concerning the contents of this publication and disclaim any warranties or merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose.

**Caveat:** View the jury instructions in this book as model instructions only. They are not intended to be used verbatim in every case. The law changes rapidly in age discrimination and you must conduct independent legal research when preparing jury instructions. Also, you will achieve the best success by tailoring the language of the instructions to match the complaint, evidence, and particular issues at hand.

We view the publication of this work as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic revisions will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggested changes. Call us at (714) 755-5450 or send your comments to:

Managing Editor  
James Publishing, Inc.  
3505 Cadillac Ave., Suite H  
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

First Edition, 6/00  
Revision 1, 7/01  
Revision 2, 5/02  
Revision 3, 9/03  
Revision 4, 8/04  
Revision 5, 9/05  
Revision 6, 7/06  
Revision 7, 8/07  
Revision 8, 10/08  
Revision 9, 8/09  
Revision 10, 8/10  
Revision 11, 7/11  
Revision 12, 5/12

### **STAFF**

Managing Editor: Lisa J. Dunne, Esq.  
Production Editor: Adam Pringle  
Production Manager: Amanda Winkler

## AUTHORS



**Cathy Ventrell-Monsees** has litigated ADEA cases for 29 years, including several ADEA class actions, and she has written more than 50 amicus briefs in the U.S. Supreme Court and circuit courts. For thirteen years, she directed an age discrimination litigation project at AARP. She is currently an attorney advisor to Commissioner Stuart Ishimaru at the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. From 2007-2010, she led Workplace Fairness as its president and served on its Board of Directors beginning in 2000. She served on the Board of Directors of the National Employment Lawyers Association from 1996-2008. She served as an employee representative on the Council of the ABA Labor and Employment Section from 1998-2002 and was co-chair of its EEO Committee from 1994-1997. She is an associate editor for the 1998

*Supplement to Employment Discrimination Law* (3d Ed.). She teaches employment discrimination law at the Washington College of Law at American University and frequently appears in the media and at conferences as an expert on age discrimination issues.

**L. Steven Platt** has litigated ADEA cases for 34 years. He has tried over 100 cases to verdict in Federal District Courts and state courts and has handled cases, appeals and amicus briefs in jurisdictions ranging from California to New York. He was elected a “Fellow” in the American College of Labor and Employment Lawyers, was the three-time Chair of the Chicago Bar Association Civil Rights Committee, is a member of the adjunct faculty of labor and employment attorneys with the Illinois Institute of Continuing Education, and was one of 18 people selected by the EEOC to participate in the negotiated rulemaking that led to the regulations adopted by the EEOC under the Older Workers Benefit Protection Act. He is also the Plaintiff/Public National Liaison, EEO Agency Liaison, and National Legislative Liaison Co-Chair of the ABA Labor and Employment EEO Committee. He has served as President of the National Employment Lawyers Association, a 3,500 member national employment lawyers group, and as President of Workplace Fairness, an organization dedicated to educating workers about their rights.



**CONTRIBUTORS**

Raymond C. Fay  
Bell, Boyd & Lloyd  
Washington, DC

Laurie A. McCann  
AARP Foundation Litigation  
Washington, DC

Katie Eyers  
Salmanson Goldshaw, P.C.  
Philadelphia, PA

Stephanie E. Trudeau  
Ulmer & Berne LLP  
Cleveland, OH

Steven Z. Chertkof  
Heller, Huron, Chertkof, Lerner,  
Simon & Salzman, PLLC  
Washington, DC

Harris D. Butler, III  
Butler, Williams & Skilling, P.C.  
Richmond, VA

Susan M. Coler  
Sprenger & Lang, PLLC  
Minneapolis, MN

**ADVISORY BOARD MEMBERS**

Frederick M. Gittes  
Spater, Gittes, Schulte & Kolman  
Columbus, OH

Laurie A. McCann  
Staff Attorney  
AARP Foundation Litigation  
Washington, DC

Glen D. Savits  
Lucas Savits & Marose  
West Orange, NJ

Evelyn J. Marose  
Lucas Savits & Marose  
West Orange, NJ

Tomas W. Osborne  
Staff Attorney  
AARP Foundation Litigation  
Washington, D.C.

Darlene A. Vorachek  
Abrahamson Vorachek & Mikva  
Chicago, IL

**DEDICATION**

We would like to thank the following attorneys for their generous contributions to this book:

Ray Fay, Bell, Boyd & Lloyd  
Washington, DC

Fred Gittes, Gittes & Schulte  
Columbus, OH

David L. Lee, Law Offices of David L. Lee,  
Chicago, IL

Laurie McCann, AARP Foundation Litigation  
Washington, D.C.

Robin Potter  
Chicago, IL

Darlene Vorachek, Abrahamson, Vorachek & Mikva  
Chicago, IL

John David Weiss, Law Offices of John D. Weiss,  
Encino, CA

Susan M. Cole, Sprenger & Lang, PLLC  
Minneapolis, MN

L. Steven Platt

Cathy Ventrell-Monsees

**SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**CHAPTER 1. THE LAW**

**CHAPTER 2. CLIENT INTAKE AND INVESTIGATION OF CLAIMS**

**CHAPTER 3. FILING SUIT**

**CHAPTER 4. DISCOVERY**

**CHAPTER 5. PROVING AGE DISCRIMINATION**

**CHAPTER 6. REMEDIES AVAILABLE UNDER ADEA**

**CHAPTER 7. SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

**CHAPTER 8. HOW YOUR OPPONENT MAY TRY TO LIMIT YOUR EVIDENCE**

**CHAPTER 9. USING EXPERTS IN AGE DISCRIMINATION CASES**

**CHAPTER 10. TRIAL**

**CHAPTER 11. REPRESENTING MULTIPLE PLAINTIFFS**

**CHAPTER 12. SETTLEMENTS**

**CHAPTER 13. AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYEE BENEFITS**

**CHAPTER 14. WORK FORCE RESTRUCTURING, DOWNSIZING,  
AND REDUCTIONS IN FORCE**

**CHAPTER 15. ATTORNEY'S FEES AND COSTS**

**APPENDIX A**

**APPENDIX B**

**APPENDIX C**

**TABLE OF CASES**

**INDEX**

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 1. THE LAW

### I. INTRODUCTION – INCREASING TREND IN CHARGES CONTINUES

#### §1:10 Impact of Baby Boomers

§1:11 Recent Trends

#### §1:20 Social and Economic Cost

#### §1:30 Historical Overview: Impact of Secretary of Labor’s Report

#### §1:40 Comparing ADEA and Title VII

§1:40.10 Coverage and Procedural Differences

§1:40.20 Differences in Methods of Proof

§1:40.30 ADEA Employer Defenses Not Found in Title VII

§1:40.40 Differences in Remedies Between ADEA and Title VII

#### §1:50 ADEA Enforced by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

### II. WHO IS COVERED?

#### §1:60 Generally

#### §1:70 “Employer” Defined

§1:70.10 General

§1:70.10.10 Parent Companies and Subsidiaries

§1:70.10.20 Supervisors and Managers

§1:70.20 States, Political Subdivisions, Legislative Bodies

§1:70.20.10 General

§1:70.20.20 Sovereign Immunity Issues

§1:70.20.30 Municipal Employers Still Subject to Private ADEA Suits for Damages

§1:70.20.40 EEOC May Sue State Employers for Damages Under ADEA

§1:70.20.50 State Licensing and Regulatory Agencies

§1:70.20.60 No §1983 Claim for Personal Liability

§1:70.30 Federal Employees

§1:70.40 Foreign Employers, Foreign Decision Making and Work Stations

§1:70.50 Labor Unions and Organizations

§1:70.60 Employment Agencies

§1:70.70 Agents

§1:70.80 Religious Organizations

§1:70.90 Membership Organizations and Associations

#### §1:80 “Employee” Defined

§1:80.10 General

§1:80.20 Independent Contractors

- §1:80.30 Partners
- §1:80.40 Shareholders and Owners
- §1:80.50 Physicians
- §1:80.60 Personal Staff Exemption
- §1:80.70 Military Employees

**§1:90 Venue**

**III. ACTS PROHIBITED**

**§1:100 Adverse Actions**

**§1:110 Favoring Older Employees Not Prohibited**

**§1:120 Advertising**

**§1:130 Reductions in Force (RIFs)**

**§1:140 Constructive Discharge**

- §1:140.10 Generally
- §1:140.20 Harassment

**§1:150 Forced Retirement**

- §1:150.10 Generally
- §1:150.20 Exceptions

**§1:160 Demotions**

**§1:170 Negative Evaluations After Years of Good Performance**

**§1:180 Exclusion From Training and Threatened Long Work Hours**

**§1:190 When Plaintiff Is Offered “Choice”**

**§1:200 Time to Consider Options**

**§1:210 Threatened Loss of Retirement Benefits if Early Retirement Not Selected**

**§1:220 Forced Transfers**

**§1:230 Refusal of Transfers**

**§1:240 Hostile Work Environment**

**§1:250 Labor Organizations/Apprenticeship Programs**

- §1:250.10 Labor Organizations
- §1:250.20 Union Apprenticeship Programs & BFOQ Defense



#### **IV. TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT**

**§1:260 Generally**

**§1:270 Reduced Hours, Denial of Overtime and Work Assignments**

**§1:280 Differences in Pay**

**§1:290 Offsetting Severance Pay Due to Retirement Benefits**

**§1:300 Elimination of Seniority**

#### **V. EMPLOYER RETALIATION**

**§1:310 In General**

**§1:320 ADEA Follows Title VII Pattern of Proof**

§1:320.10 Cases Applying Title VII Formula to ADEA Retaliation Claims

§1:320.20 Cases Holding Reasonable Belief Establishes Claim

**§1:330 Two Types of Protected Activity**

§1:330.10 Facilitating ADEA Enforcement

§1:330.20 Opposing Employer's Discriminatory Practices

**§1:340 What Constitutes "Adverse Action"**

§1:340.10 Examples of Adverse Action

§1:340.20 Mere Inconvenience Not Actionable

**§1:350 What Constitutes "Causation"**

§1:350.10 "Causal Link"

§1:350.20 Proximity in Time

**§1:360 Retaliation Remedies**

§1:360.10 Form: Motion for Preliminary Injunction Reinstating Plaintiff to Maintain Status Quo

#### **VI. EMPLOYER DEFENSES**

**§1:370 Bona Fide Occupational Qualification (BFOQ)**

**§1:380 Two-Pronged Test**

**§1:390 Maximum Hiring Ages**

**§1:400 Reasonable Factors Other Than Age**

§1:410 Seniority Systems and Employee Benefit Plan Exceptions

§1:420 Foreign Workplace Defense

## **VII. MANDATORY ARBITRATION**

§1:430 The *Circuit City* Case

§1:440 Checklist to Attack Arbitration Agreements

§1:450 Form: Brief to Resist Mandatory Arbitration

## **CHAPTER 2. CLIENT INTAKE AND INVESTIGATION OF CLAIMS**

### **I. INITIAL CLIENT INTERVIEW**

§2:10 Telephone Interview

§2:20 In-Person Interview

§2:30 Special Questions for Reduction-in-Force Claims

§2:40 How to Recognize a Claim – Basic Evidence

§2:40.10 *Prima Facie* Case

§2:40.20 Plaintiff's Burden

§2:40.30 Direct Evidence

§2:40.40 Direct Evidence Method

§2:40.50 Employer's Pretext for Discrimination

§2:50 Form: Intake Questionnaire

### **II. RETAINER AGREEMENTS**

§2:60 Introduction

§2:70 Drafting Considerations

§2:70.10 Case Law

### **III. FORM**

§2:80 Retainer Agreement, Initial Client Review

## **CHAPTER 3. FILING SUIT**

### **I. ADMINISTRATIVE PREREQUISITES**

#### **A. Statutory Requirements**

§3:10 Charge Filing Required

§3:20 Adherence to Deadlines

#### **B. Charge-Filing Deadlines**

§3:30 Background

§3:40 Determining Proper Deadline

§3:40.10 300-Day States

§3:40.10.10 Filing With FEP Agency

§3:40.10.20 Filing With EEOC

§3:40.20 180-Day States

§3:50 Actual Date of Charge Filing

§3:50.10 Tips for Attorney-Drafted Charges

#### **C. Starting Point of Filing Period**

§3:60 Date Unlawful Employment Practice Occurred

§3:60.10 Notice of Act or Discrimination

§3:60.10.10 Accrual Date

§3:60.10.20 Discovery Rule

§3:60.20 Unequivocal Notice

§3:60.30 Other Facts Triggering Filing Period

§3:60.40 Constructive Discharge Claims

§3:60.50 Pay or Compensation Claims

§3:70 Discriminatory Policies, Seniority Systems, and Benefit Plans

§3:70.10 Facially Discriminatory Policies and Plans

§3:70.20 Neutral Policies and Plans

§3:70.30 Older Workers Benefit Protection Act

§3:80 ERISA Method

§3:90 Harassment, Systemic, or Pattern and Practice Claims

§3:90.10 Consequences of Time-Barred Discriminatory Acts

## **D. Actions After Clock Starts**

### **§3:100 Clock Stops**

- §3:100.10 Equitable Tolling vs. Equitable Estoppel
- §3:100.20 Equitable Tolling
- §3:100.30 Equitable Estoppel
  - §3:100.30.10 Employer's Failure to Post ADEA §8 Notice
  - §3:100.30.20 Employer Misconduct/Misrepresentations

## **E. Form and Contents of Charge**

### **§3:110 Overview**

### **§3:120 Form of the "Charge" – Oral Communication, Letter, Intake Questionnaire or EEOC Form 5**

- §3:120.10 Form: EEOC Form 5

### **§3:130 Content**

### **§3:140 Scope**

## **F. Filing Charge**

### **§3:150 Who Can File**

- §3:150.10 Single Filing Rule
- §3:150.20 Calculating Filing Period of Claims Covered by Single Filing Rule
- §3:150.30 Employees Working for Companies Outside United States

## **II. DEALING EFFECTIVELY WITH EEOC**

### **A. Charge Prioritization System of EEOC**

#### **§3:160 Overview**

#### **§3:170 Category A: Enforcement Plan/Potential Cause Charges**

#### **§3:180 Category B: Charges Requiring Additional Information**

#### **§3:190 Category C: Charges Suitable for Dismissal**

### **B. EEOC's Enforcement Plans**

#### **§3:200 Overview**

#### **§3:210 National Enforcement Plan**

#### **§3:220 Local Enforcement Plans**

**C. Initial Charge Processing**

§3:230 EEOC Counseling

§3:240 Communicating With EEOC

**D. Charge Determinations by EEOC**

§3:250 Dismissals and Notices of Right to Sue

§3:260 Cause Determinations

§3:270 Attempts to Settle Charge

**E. Prerequisites to Filing Lawsuit**

§3:280 Steps Prior to Filing

§3:290 60-Day Rule – Early Filing of Lawsuit

§3:290.10 No “Right-to-Sue” Letter Needed to File Suit

§3:290.20 Administrative Exhaustion Is Not a Jurisdictional Prerequisite to Suit

§3:300 Simultaneous Filing

§3:310 60 Days from Last Filing

§3:320 60 Days for EEOC Conciliation

§3:330 90-Day Rule for Filing Suit

§3:340 Determinations by State FEP Agency

§3:350 EEOC Investigation and Litigation: Absent a Charge

§3:360 EEOC Litigation Precludes Private Suits

**F. Checklists**

§3:370 Charge-Filing Checklist

§3:380 Date and Deadline Checklist

**G. Federal Employees**

§3:390 Federal Charge Procedures

§3:390.10 First Step: Contact Federal EEO Counselor

§3:390.20 Mandatory “EEO Counseling”

- §3:390.30 “Voluntary” Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR)
- §3:390.40 Filing a Charge
- §3:390.50 Dismissal of Charge
- §3:390.60 How Investigations Are Handled
- §3:390.70 Method of Investigation
- §3:390.80 Conduct of Administrative Hearings
- §3:390.90 Contents of the Complaint File
- §3:390.100 Final Decision by the Agency
- §3:390.110 Appeal of ALJ Decision to Office of Federal Operations
- §3:390.120 Filing an “Appeal” as a Lawsuit in Federal Court
- §3:390.130 Federal Employee Class Actions
- §3:390.140 Grievances as Civil Rights Actions
- §3:390.150 Mixed Case Complaints

### **III. FILING AN ADEA LAWSUIT IN FEDERAL COURT**

#### **§3:400 Jurisdictional Prerequisites**

#### **§3:410 Venue, Jurisdiction**

#### **§3:420 Parties**

#### **§3:430 Factual Allegations**

#### **§3:440 Damages**

#### **§3:450 Forms**

- §3:450.10 Form: Sample Complaint – ADEA Lawsuit
- §3:450.20 Form: Class Action ADEA Complaint – Annotated
- §3:450.30 Form: Complaint – ADEA Willful; Non-Willful

## **CHAPTER 4. DISCOVERY**

### **I. OVERVIEW DISCOVERY STRATEGY**

#### **§4:10 Proving a *Prima Facie* Case**

- §4:10.10 How Comprehensive Can Discovery Be?

#### **§4:20 Pretext**

### **II. DOCUMENT REQUESTS**

#### **§4:25 Pre-Filing Discovery Request**

- §4:25.10 Form: Motion for Expedited Discovery and Preservation

**§4:30 Generally**

§4:30.10 Form: Plaintiff's Rule 26 Disclosures

§4:30.20 Form: Complainant's Initial Document Requests to Respondent

**§4:40 Plaintiff's Checklist**

**§4:50 Defendant's Checklist**

**§4:60 Forms: Request for Production of Documents – Termination**

§4:60.10 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Termination of Sales Representative – Age Discrimination/Retaliation

§4:60.20 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Termination – Administrative Assistant

§4:60.30 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Termination; Failure to Promote

**§4:70 Forms: Request for Production of Documents – Failure to Hire**

§4:70.10 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Failure to Hire

§4:70.20 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Failure to Hire

**§4:80 Forms: Request for Production of Documents – State Human Rights Commission**

§4:80.10 Form: Request for Production of Documents – State Human Rights Commission – Termination

§4:80.20 Form: Request for Production of Documents – State Human Rights Commission – Termination – Longer Version

§4:80.30 Form: Complainant's First Set of Requests for Production of Documents – RIF

**§4:90 Form: Plaintiff's Request for Production of Documents – Electronic Discovery**

**§4:110 [Reserved]**

**§4:120 Form: Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's Document Request**

**III. INTERROGATORIES**

**§4:130 Generally**

**§4:140 Plaintiff's Approach**

**§4:150 Plaintiff's Checklist**

§4:151 Investigatory, Contention and Occurrence Interrogatories

§4:151.10 Investigatory

§4:151.20 Contention

§4:151.30 Occurrence

**§4:160 Expert Witness Checklist**

**§4:170 Defendant's Checklist**

**§4:180 Forms: Interrogatories – Termination of Employee**

§4:180.10 Form: Interrogatories – Termination of Employee; Failure to Promote

§4:180.20 Form: Interrogatories to Defendant – Federal Court – Termination; RIF

§4:180.30 Form: Complainant's Interrogatories to Respondent – Age/Disability  
Discrimination

**§4:190 Form: Interrogatories – Failure to Hire**

**§4:200 Form: Interrogatories – Failure to Promote**

§4:200.10 Form: Interrogatories – Plaintiff's First Set to Defendant –  
Failure to Promote

**§4:210 Form: Interrogatories – Demotion/Termination**

**§4:220 Form: Interrogatories – To Defendant's Experts**

**§4:230 Forms: Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Interrogatories**

§4:230.10 Form: Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Interrogatories – Termination/  
Retaliation – Intentional and Reckless

§4:230.20 Form: Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Interrogatories – Termination;  
Failure to Promote

§4:230.30 Form: Plaintiff's Responses and Objections to First Set of  
Interrogatories – Termination – RIF

**§4:240 Forms: Interrogatories – State Human Rights Commission**

§4:241 Form: Interrogatories – State Human Rights Commission –  
Demotion/Failure to Promote

§4:242 Form: Interrogatories – Termination – Discriminatory Comments –  
State Human Rights Commission

§4:243 Form: Interrogatories – RIF – State Human Rights Commission

§4:244 Form: Interrogatories to Complainant – RIF – State Human Rights  
Commission

§4:245 Form: Supplemental Interrogatories to Complainant – RIF – State Human  
Rights Commission

**§4:250 [Reserved]**

**IV. REQUESTS TO ADMIT**

**§4:260 Generally**

**§4:270 Plaintiff Checklist**

**§4:280 Forms: Requests for Admissions**

§4:281 Form: Plaintiff's Requests for Admissions – Termination

§4:282 Form: Plaintiff's Requests for Admissions – Failure to Hire/Promote



- §4:283 Form: Plaintiff's First Request for Admissions
- §4:284 Form: Complainant's First Request for Admissions – RIF – State Human Rights Commission
- §4:285 Form: Complainant's Requests to Admit – Age/Disability Discrimination

## **V. DEPOSITIONS**

### **§4:300 Generally**

### **§4:310 Objective of Deposition**

### **§4:320 Who to Depose**

### **§4:330 Plaintiff's Pre-Deposition Checklist**

- §4:330.10 Form: Notice of Deposition

### **§4:340 Plaintiff's Deposition Preparation**

- §4:340.10 Review Documents With Plaintiff Prior to Plaintiff's Deposition
- §4:340.20 Discuss Process and Questions With Plaintiff in Preparation for Plaintiff's Deposition
- §4:340.30 Defense Strategy in Deposing Plaintiff
- §4:340.40 Plaintiff Strategy in Deposing Defense Witnesses
- §4:340.50 General Deposition Rules

## **VI. EXPERT WITNESSES**

### **§4:350 Statistical Experts**

### **§4:360 Damages Experts**

### **§4:370 Psychotherapists**

### **§4:380 Vocational Experts**

## **VII. PROTECTIVE ORDERS**

### **§4:390 Access to Non-Party Files**

- §4:390.10 Protective Orders Regarding Chief Operating Officers

## **VIII. DISCOVERY MOTIONS**

### **§4:400 Motions to Compel Production**

### **§4:410 Form: Plaintiff's Motion to Compel Defendant's Rule 26(a)(1) Disclosures**

## **CHAPTER 5. PROVING AGE DISCRIMINATION**

### **I. GENERAL METHODS OF PROOF**

#### **A. Introduction**

§5:10 ADEA Prohibitions

§5:20 Overview

§5:30 Pleading Requirements

### **II. DISPARATE TREATMENT**

§5:40 Direct vs. Indirect Methods of Proving Disparate Treatment

#### **A. Direct Method of Proof**

§5:50 Definition of Direct Evidence

§5:60 Types of Direct Evidence

§5:60.10 Facially Discriminatory Plans and Policies

§5:60.20 Factors Inextricably Linked to Age

§5:60.30 Age Consciousness

§5:60.40 Ageist Statements Constituting Direct Evidence

§5:70 Circumstantial Evidence Under the Direct Method of Proof

§5:80 Types of Circumstantial Evidence Under the Direct Method of Proof

§5:80.10 Ageist Comments as Circumstantial Evidence

§5:80.20 Comparative Evidence—Disparate Treatment of Similarly Situated Employees

§5:80.30 Employer's Failure to Follow Corporate Policies or Procedures

#### **B. Indirect Method of Proof**

§5:90 *McDonnell Douglas* Indirect Proof Method

§5:90.10 *McDonnell Douglas* Framework Still Applies After *Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.*

§5:90.10.10 Courts Applying *McDonnell Douglas* Framework After *Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.*

§5:90.10.20 Courts Modifying *McDonnell Douglas* Framework and Imposing Heightened Standards of Proof After *Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.*

§5:90.20 Courts Err in Rigid Adherence to *McDonnell Douglas*

**§5:100 *Prima Facie* Case**

- §5:100.10 Plaintiff Sought the Position
- §5:100.20 Position Is Vacant
- §5:100.30 Plaintiff Is Qualified/Performing Satisfactorily
  - §5:100.30.10 Employee Is Incumbent
  - §5:100.30.20 Conflicting Evidence of Qualifications in SSDI Applications
  - §5:100.30.30 Relevance of Performance to the *Prima Facie* Case, Employer's Reason, and Pretext
- §5:100.40 Adverse Employment Action: Defined
- §5:100.50 Employer Knowledge of Plaintiff's Age
- §5:100.60 Treatment of Younger Employees
  - §5:100.60.10 Similarly Situated Requirement
  - §5:100.60.20 Substantially Younger Comparator
- §5:100.70 Discharge Cases
  - §5:100.70.10 General
  - §5:100.70.20 Reductions in Force

**§5:110 Employer's Assertion of a Legitimate, Nondiscriminatory Reason**

**§5:120 Pretext**

- §5:120.10 False Reasons
  - §5:120.10.10 Employer's Honest or Mistaken Belief
- §5:120.20 Changing or Inconsistent Reasons
- §5:120.30 Using Statistical Evidence to Support Showing of Pretext

**C. Because of Age**

**§5:130 *Gross v. FBL* Disallows "Motivating Factor" Standard and Burden Shifting Analysis of *Price Waterhouse* or Title VII Section 703(m) in ADEA Cases**

- §5:130.10 A Determining Factor Establishes Liability
- §5:130.20 Multiple Claim Cases Are Not "Mixed Motive" Cases
- §5:130.30 Likely Legislative Response to *Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.*
- §5:130.40 *Gross* Does Not Apply to Federal Employees' ADEA Claims

**§5:140 The Debate Over the Various Methods of Proving Disparate Treatment**

**D. Types of Evidence**

**§5:150 Ageist Comments vs. Stray Remarks**

- §5:150.10 Ageist Statements as Direct Evidence
  - §5:150.10.10 Comments About Retirement
- §5:150.20 Clarity and Content of the Statement
- §5:150.30 Content vs. Context of Ageist Statement
- §5:150.40 Statements by Decision-Makers
- §5:150.50 Standards for Subordinate Bias Liability (AKA "Cat's Paw" or "Rubber Stamp" Liability)
  - §5:150.50.10 Statements by Non-Decision-Makers
- §5:150.60 Ageist Statements Made to Others

**§5:160 Comparative Evidence**

**§5:170 Corporate Culture and Stereotyping Evidence**

§5:170.10 Circuit Analyses

§5:170.20 Unconscious or Hidden Discrimination

§5:170.30 Discovery of Culture and Stereotyping Evidence

§5:170.40 Statements Evidencing an Ageist Corporate Culture

**III. DISPARATE IMPACT**

**A. Introduction**

**§5:180 Overview**

**§5:190 *Smith v. City of Jackson* Holds ADEA Permits Impact Claims**

§5:190.10 Plurality Opinion in *Smith v. City of Jackson*

§5:190.20 Justice Scalia's Deference to EEOC's Regulations

§5:190.30 Justice O'Connor's Refusal to Recognize Disparate Impact Under the ADEA

**B. Applying Disparate Impact Analysis After *Smith v. City of Jackson***

**§5:200 Establishing a Disparate Impact Claim After *Smith v. City of Jackson* and *Meacham v. Knolls***

§5:200.10 Identify Particular Practice That Caused the Impact

§5:200.20 Statistically Demonstrate a Disproportionate Impact

**§5:210 The Reasonable Factor Other Than Age Defense to Disparate Impact Claims**

§5:210.10 Employer Must Plead RFOA as an Affirmative Defense

§5:210.20 Factor Cannot Be Related to Age

§5:210.30 Factor Must Be Job-Related to Be Reasonable

§5:210.40 *Wards Cove* Does Not Apply to ADEA Disparate Impact Defense

§5:210.50 Circuit Court's Application of *Smith v. City of Jackson*

**§5:220 Plaintiff's Rebuttal in Disparate Impact Cases**

**§5:230 New EEOC Rule on Defense to Disparate Impact Claims**

**C. Using Disparate Impact Model in Disparate Treatment Cases**

**§5:240 Discussion**

## **IV. STATISTICAL EVIDENCE**

### **§5:250 Disparate Treatment Cases**

§5:250.10 Age-Break Analysis in Disparate Impact Cases

§5:250.20 Non-Parametric Tests

§5:250.30 Regression Analysis

## **V. AGE PLUS THEORY OF INTERSECTIONAL DISCRIMINATION**

§5:260 Age Plus Another Protected Trait

## **VI. APPENDIX**

§5:270 Jury Instructions – Because of Age

## **CHAPTER 6. REMEDIES AVAILABLE UNDER ADEA**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

§6:10 Overview

### **II. AVAILABLE REMEDIES**

#### **A. Equitable Remedies**

§6:20 Preliminary Injunctions

§6:30 Permanent Injunctions

§6:30.10 Broad Injunctions

§6:30.20 Narrow Injunctions

§6:40 Reinstatement, Instatement, and Other Relief

§6:40.10 Reinstatement Appropriate

§6:40.20 Reinstatement Inappropriate

§6:40.30 Hearing

§6:50 Front Pay

§6:50.10 Determining Front Pay

§6:50.20 Number of Years Granted

§6:50.30 Offsets

§6:50.40 Calculations

§6:50.50 Decision by Judge or Jury

## **B. Legal Remedies**

### **§6:60 Backpay**

- §6:60.10 Determining Backpay
  - §6:60.10.10 Lost Raises
  - §6:60.10.20 Lost Pension Benefit Contributions
  - §6:60.10.30 Life Insurance Premiums
  - §6:60.10.40 Health Insurance
  - §6:60.10.50 Earnings From Other Sources
- §6:60.20 Income From Collateral Sources
- §6:60.30 Employee's Duty to Mitigate Damages
  - §6:60.30.10 Effect of Employer's Offer of Reinstatement
  - §6:60.30.20 Need For Absolute Offer of Reinstatement
  - §6:60.30.30 Employer's Burden to Show Unreasonable Rejection of Offer
  - §6:60.30.40 Employee's Duty to Conduct Job Search
  - §6:60.30.50 Employer's Burden to Show Unreasonable Job Search
  - §6:60.30.60 Voluntary Resignation
  - §6:60.30.70 Unavailability for Work
  - §6:60.30.80 Elimination of Plaintiff's Position

### **§6:70 Liquidated Damages**

- §6:70.10 Unavailable in Cases Against Federal Government or Agencies
  - §6:70.10.10 Available Against Municipalities/Public Agencies
- §6:70.20 Determining Double Damages
- §6:70.30 Determining "Willfulness"
- §6:70.40 Effect of Death of Plaintiff on Liquidated Damages

### **§6:80 Compensatory Damages**

### **§6:90 Punitive Damages**

### **§6:100 Interest**

### **§6:110 Costs**

- §6:110.10 Attorneys' Fees
  - §6:110.10.10 "Reasonable" Fees
  - §6:110.10.20 Calculation of Attorneys' Fees Award
  - §6:110.10.30 Right to Recover Attorneys' Fees. Award
  - §6:110.10.40 Recoverability of Time Spent in Administrative Proceedings
  - §6:110.10.50 Interest on Attorneys' Fees Award
  - §6:110.10.60 "Prevailing Party" for Purposes of Attorneys' Fees Award
  - §6:110.10.70 Discovery and Hearing
  - §6:110.10.80 Taxability of Attorneys' Fees Award
  - §6:110.10.90 Attorneys' Fees in ADEA Actions

## **CHAPTER 7. SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

**§7:10 The Battleground**

### **II. PROCEDURAL PRINCIPLES**

**§7:20 Summary Judgment Standards**

**§7:30 Governing Rules**

**§7:40 Timing of Motion for Summary Judgment**

**§7:50 Minimum Time and Notice for Plaintiff's Response**

**§7:60 Insist on Discovery Critical to Opposing Motion for Summary Judgment**

§7:60.10 File Rule 56(f) Motion or Affidavit Stating Why Discovery Is Needed

§7:60.10.10 Form: Rule 56(f) Motion Stating Why Discovery Is Needed

§7:60.20 Failure to Pursue Discovery Can Nullify Right to Seek Discovery Under Rule 56(f)

§7:60.30 Discovery Motions Are Not Responsive Pleadings to a Rule 56 Motion for Summary Judgment

**§7:70 Materials Supporting Opposition to Summary Judgment**

§7:70.10 Materials Must Be in Record

§7:70.10.10 Oppose Defendant's Statement of Uncontested Facts

§7:70.20 Materials Challenging Veracity of Defendant's Reasons

§7:70.30 Using or Challenging Summary Judgment Affidavits

§7:70.40 Base Affidavits on Personal Knowledge

§7:70.50 Avoid Affidavits That Are Conclusory, Purely Self-Serving, or Based on Generalizations

§7:70.60 Do Not Use Plaintiff's Affidavit to Patch Up His Deposition

§7:70.70 Form: Reply per Local Rule to Defendant's Statement of Undisputed Facts

**§7:80 Plaintiff Strategies**

### **III. METHODS OF PROOF AND SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

**§7:90 Overview of Methods of Proving Age Discrimination**

**§7:100 Plaintiff's Burden to Make *Prima Facie* Case**

§7:100.10 Establishing Qualifications or Satisfactory Performance

§7:100.20 Alleging an Adverse Employment Action

§7:100.30 Summary Judgment on the 4th Element of the *Prima Facie* Case

**§7:110 *Prima Facie* Analysis in RIF Cases**

- §7:110.10 Form: Brief in Response to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment  
– *Prima Facie* Analysis in RIF Case

**§7:120 Alternative Methods of Establishing *Prima Facie* Case**

**IV. PRESENTING SUFFICIENT PRETEXT EVIDENCE**

**§7:130 Plaintiff’s Objectives in Proving Pretext**

**§7:140 Pretext After *Reeves v. Sanderson Plumbing Products, Inc.***

- §7:140.10 Form: Plaintiff’s Memorandum in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment

**§7:150 Challenging the Employer’s Reasons**

- §7:150.10 Cast Doubt From Ever-Changing Reasons
- §7:150.20 Cast Doubt From “Bagful” of Reasons
- §7:150.30 Challenging Subjective and Objective Reasons
- §7:150.40 Do Not Allow Employer’s “Business Judgment” to Be a Shield for Discrimination
- §7:150.50 Employer’s Honest Belief Is Not Pretext
- §7:150.60 Rebutting Defendant’s Cost Argument
- §7:150.70 Challenging Implausible Reasons
- §7:150.80 Inconsistent Application of Policies or Procedures
- §7:150.90 Challenge Inferences Against Discrimination
  - §7:150.90.10 Same Bad Actor Theory
    - §7:150.90.10.10 Challenging Same Actor Inference
  - §7:150.90.20 Age of the Decision-Maker

**V. TYPES OF EVIDENCE**

**§7:160 Using Evidence of Discriminatory Comments to Withstand Summary Judgment**

- §7:160.10 Ageist Comments Constituting Direct Evidence
- §7:160.20 Statements by Decision-Makers
- §7:160.30 Statements by Non-Decision-Makers
- §7:160.40 Statements Evidencing an Ageist Corporate Culture
- §7:160.50 Ageist Statements Made to Others

**§7:170 Disputed Qualifications as Evidence of Pretext**

- §7:170.10 Superior Qualifications as Evidence of Pretext
- §7:170.20 More-Than-Comparable Qualifications Are Needed to Demonstrate Pretext

**§7:180 Statistical Evidence**



## **VI. SUMMARY JUDGMENT FORMS**

**§7:190 Differential Treatment of Similarly Situated Employees**

**§7:200 Opposition Briefs**

§7:200.10 Form: Plaintiff's Memo in Opposition to Defendant's MSJ – RIF Case

§7:200.20 Form: Plaintiff's Memo in Opposition to Defendant's MSJ – RIF Case (II)

§7:200.30 Form: Plaintiff's Memo in Opposition to Defendant's MSJ – Direct Evidence

**§7:210 Form: Plaintiff's Appeal of Grant of Summary Judgment**

**§7:220 Form: Plaintiff/Appellant's Reply Brief on Appeal of Grant of Summary Judgment**

## **CHAPTER 8. HOW YOUR OPPONENT MAY TRY TO LIMIT YOUR EVIDENCE**

### **I. EXCLUDING EXPERT TESTIMONY: *DAUBERT***

**§8:10 Introduction**

**§8:20 *Daubert* Opinion**

**§8:30 *Daubert* and Age Discrimination**

§8:30.10 Statistics

§8:30.10.10 *Adams v. Ameritech Services, Inc.*

§8:30.10.20 Demographic/Census Data

§8:30.20 Stereotyping

### **II. EXCLUDING TESTIMONY OF AGE-RELATED STATEMENTS**

**§8:40 Introduction**

**§8:50 Cases in Which Remarks Were Excluded**

**§8:60 Cases in Which Remarks Were Admitted**

§8:60.10 Form: Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion to Exclude Evidence

**§8:70 Cases Where Motion in Limine to Exclude Age-Related Remarks Granted in Part, Denied in Part**

**§8:80 Cases Where Motions for Summary Judgment or Judgment N.O.V. Were Involved**

### **III. DAMAGES ISSUES**

§8:90 Bifurcation of Damages and Liability Phases

§8:100 Whether Front Pay Should Be Computed by Court or Jury

### **IV. OTHER MOTIONS IN LIMINE**

§8:110 Post-Termination Evidence

§8:110.10 Post-Firing Performance of Replacement Worker

§8:110.20 Hiring of Other Older Workers Post-Termination

§8:120 EEOC Letters of Violation and Probable Cause Statements

§8:130 Terminated Employee's Incompleted Training

§8:140 Employee's Reputation

§8:150 Treatment of Non-Similarly Situated Employees

§8:160 Financial Earnings of Defendant After Reduction in Force

§8:170 Disparate Impact

§8:180 After-Acquired Evidence

§8:190 Plaintiff's Failure to Make Offer of Proof

## **CHAPTER 9. USING EXPERTS IN AGE DISCRIMINATION CASES**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

§9:10 Overview

### **II. CHOOSING EXPERTS AND AREAS OF EXPERTISE**

§9:20 Areas of Expert Testimony In Age Discrimination Cases

§9:20.10 Statistical

§9:20.20 Age Stereotyping

§9:20.30 Emotional Distress

§9:20.40 Employment Practices

§9:20.50 Damages

§9:20.60 Business Practices

**§9:30 Finding and Selecting Experts**

**§9:40 Lawyers' Role in Preparing Experts**

**III. EXPERT DEPOSITIONS**

**§9:50 Introduction**

§9:50.10 Reasons to Depose Expert

§9:50.20 Reasons Not to Depose Expert

**§9:60 Goals for Expert Deposition**

**§9:70 Preparing for Deposition**

**§9:80 Areas for Examination**

**§9:90 [Reserved]**

**IV. EXPERTS AT TRIAL**

**§9:100 Examining Expert Who Was Not Deposed**

§9:100.10 Introduction

§9:100.10.10 Benefits of “Blind” Examination

§9:100.10.20 Case Example

§9:100.20 Defense Expert's Objectives

§9:100.20.10 The “Bought Expert”

§9:100.20.20 The Expert Who Is Challenged as Being “Affiliated” With the Side That Hired Him

§9:100.20.30 Client Considerations

§9:100.20.40 Control the Witness Example: Examiner Effects

§9:100.20.50 Avoid Historic Hysterical Gambits Unless You Are Sure You Can Pull it Off

§9:100.20.60 The Language of Expert Testimony

§9:100.30 Real Life Examples

§9:100.30.10 The Defense Expert in the *Mars* Case

§9:100.30.20 Example 2: Defendant's Expert in State Court

**§9:110 *In Limine* Hearings**

**§9:120 Voir Dire**

**§9:130 Experts' Use of Demonstrative Evidence**

**§9:140 Consultative Experts at Trial**

**§9:150 Elements of Persuasive Expert Witness Testimony**

## **V. LEGAL ISSUES**

### **§9:160 “Gatekeeper” Function**

§9:160.10 *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*

§9:160.20 *General Electric Co. v. Joiner*

§9:160.30 *Kumho Tire Co. v. Carmichael*

§9:160.40 Rule 702 Supersedes *Daubert*

§9:160.41 Improper Extrapolation

§9:160.42 Reliance on Anecdotal Evidence

§9:160.43 Reliance on Temporal Proximity

§9:160.44 Insufficient Connection Between Expert’s Opinion and Case

§9:160.45 Failure to Consider Other Possible Causes

§9:160.46 Lack of Testing

§9:160.47 Subjectivity

§9:160.50 Defending and Attacking Expert Witnesses Under New Rules

§9:160.51 Plaintiff’s Motion *in Limine* to Exclude Expert Testimony

§9:160.52 Plaintiff’s Reply in Support of Plaintiff’s Motion in *Limine* to Determine Admissibility of Expert Testimony and Response to Cross-Motion on Same Issue

### **§9:170 Expert Report**

§9:170.10 Who Must Provide Report?

§9:170.20 Scope of Report

§9:170.30 Discoverability of Expert and Attorney Work-Product

§9:170.40 Rebuttal Experts

§9:170.50 Supplemental Reports

### **§9:180 Issues Regarding Particular Kinds of Experts**

§9:180.10 Treating Physicians as Experts

§9:180.20 Statisticians as Experts

§9:180.30 Vocational Experts

§9:180.40 Actuaries, Economists and Other Experts

### **§9:190 Fees**

§9:190.10 Responding to Discovery

§9:190.20 Lodging and Travel

## **CHAPTER 10. TRIAL**

### **I. STRATEGIES**

#### **§10:10 Introduction**

#### **§10:20 Motions *in Limine***

§10:20.10 Defendant’s Objectives

§10:20.20 Plaintiff’s Objectives

§10:20.30 Factors Weighed in Grant or Denial

- §10:20.35 Rule 401 Issues
- §10:20.40 Rule 403 Exclusions
- §10:20.50 Rule 404 Exclusions
- §10:20.60 Rule 408 Exclusions
- §10:20.70 Lay Witness Opinion Testimony
- §10:20.80 Other Acts of Discrimination
- §10:20.90 Other Ground for Motions *in Limine*
- §10:20.100 Forms
- §10:20.110 Form: Defendant’s Motion *in Limine* – Reduction in Force – Age/Race Discrimination
- §10:20.120 Form: Plaintiff’s Motion to Exclude Manager’s Testimony About What Plaintiff’s Coworkers Said
- §10:20.130 Form: Plaintiff’s Reply to Defendant’s Motion to Exclude Evidence of Promotions of Younger, Similarly Situated Workers

**§10:30 Using Expert Witnesses**

- §10:30.10 *Daubert* Standards
- §10:30.20 Plaintiff’s Expert Witnesses
- §10:30.30 Defendant’s Expert Witnesses
- §10:30.40 Avoiding Expert Witness Challenges Before Trial
- §10:30.50 Using Expert Testimony on Statistics
  - §10:30.50.10 “Employee Flow” Information
  - §10:30.50.20 Small Sample Size
  - §10:30.50.30 Age Groupings and Manipulation of Statistics

**II. PROVING DAMAGES**

**§10:40 ADEA Damages Limits; Pendant State Claims**

**§10:50 Evaluating Damages**

- §10:50.10 Backpay
- §10:50.20 Liquidated Damages
- §10:50.30 Client’s Rejection of Reinstatement Offers
- §10:50.40 Pension Benefits – No Offset
- §10:50.50 Client’s Actions Stopping Backpay Accrual
- §10:50.60 Tax Considerations

**§10:60 Proving Backpay**

- §10:60.10 “Same Decision” Defense
- §10:60.20 After-Acquired Evidence Defense
- §10:60.30 Calculating Claim
- §10:60.40 Limitation Periods
- §10:60.50 Overtime Pay Included
- §10:60.60 Pension or Savings Plans
- §10:60.70 Health Insurance Costs
- §10:60.80 Setoffs

**§10:70 Proof Issues Concerning Reinstatement**

§10:70.10 Hostility

**§10:80 Proving Front Pay**

§10:80.10 Determination by Judge or Jury

**§10:90 Proving Willfulness**

§10:90.10 Direct Evidence

§10:90.20 Circumstantial Evidence

**III. JURIES**

**§10:100 Mock Juries**

**§10:110 Juror Questionnaires**

**§10:120 Dealing With Juror Biases**

**§10:130 Form: Plaintiff's Proposed Voir Dire**

**§10:131 Overturning Jury Verdicts**

**IV. JURY INSTRUCTIONS**

**A. Age Discrimination**

**§10:140 Form: Overview**

**§10:150 Form: Statutory Language**

**§10:160 Form: Essential Elements of Plaintiff's Claim**

§10:160.10 Jury Instructions on the *McDonnell Douglas* Framework

**§10:161 Form: ADEA – Disparate Treatment – Essential Elements (Mixed Motive)**

**§10:162 Form: Element and Damage Instructions**

**§10:170 Form: “Intentional Discrimination” – Definition and Proof**

**§10:180 Form: Proof of Plaintiff's Age Discrimination Claims**

**§10:181 Form: Burden of Proof – ADEA Cases**

**§10:182 Form: Burden of Proof – ADEA Cases – Alternate**

**§10:183 Form: Direct Evidence of Age Discrimination**

**§10:184 Form: Proof of Intent**

**§10:185 Form: Proof of Adequate Performance**

**§10:190 Form: Decisions Made for Reasonable Factors Other Than Age –  
Defendant Instruction**

**§10:200 Form: Subjective Judgments – Defendant Instruction**

**§10:210 Form: Actions Not Prohibited – Defendant Instruction**

**§10:220 Form: Alleged Unfair Treatment – Defendant Instruction**

**§10:230 Form: Less Favorable Treatment Than Non-Protected Individuals**

**§10:240 Form: Pretext**  
§10:240.10 Failure to Instruct Jury on Pretext

**§10:241 Form: “Pretext” Defined**

**§10:242 Form: Proof of Pretext**

**§10:250 Form: Method of Proving Pretext**

**§10:260 Form: Interrogatory – Pretext Case**

**§10:270 Form: Motivating Factor**

**§10:271 Form: Determining Factor**

**§10:280 Form: Willfulness**

**§10:281 Form: ADEA – Disparate Treatment – Willfulness – Eighth Circuit**

**B. Special Interrogatories**

**§10:290 Form: Adverse Employment Action**

**§10:300 Form: Causal Link Between Age and Adverse Employment Action**

**§10:310 Form: Performance Evaluation**

**§10:320 Form: Termination No. 1**

**§10:330 Form: Termination No. 2**

**§10:340 Form: Termination No. 3**

### **C. Retaliation**

- §10:350 Form: *Prima Facie* Case
- §10:360 Form: “Retaliation” – Definition
- §10:370 Form: Essential Elements
- §10:380 Form: Essential Elements – Alternate
- §10:390 Form: Plaintiff’s Burden
- §10:400 Form: Evidence To Consider
- §10:410 Form: Pattern or Practice – Retaliation
- §10:420 Form: Determinative Factor

### **1. DAMAGES**

- §10:430 Form: Overview
- §10:440 Form: Backpay
- §10:450 Form: Backpay – Prevented from Returning to Work on Light Duty
- §10:460 Form: Retaliation – Willfulness – Discussion

### **2. SPECIAL INTERROGATORIES – RETALIATION**

- §10:470 Form: Interrogatory – Retaliation
- §10:480 Form: Retaliation Via Low Performance Evaluation
- §10:490 Form: Retaliation Via Particular Assignment
- §10:500 Form: Retaliation – Refusal to Buy Back Unused Vacation Days
- §10:510 Form: Retaliation – Refusal to Allow Plaintiff to Return to Work on Light Duty

### **D. Harassment**

- §10:520 Form: Tangible Employment Action



- §10:530 Form: Liability When Tangible Employment Action Taken
- §10:540 Form: Liability When Tangible Employment Action Taken – Short Form
- §10:550 Form: Liability When No Tangible Employment Action Taken
- §10:560 Form: “Supervisor” – Definition
- §10:570 Form: “Supervisory Status” – Definition
- §10:580 Form: Vicarious Liability for Harassment
- §10:590 Form: Harassment – Acquiescence and Adverse Action

### **E. Damages**

- §10:600 Form: Overview
- §10:601 Form: ADEA – Disparate Treatment – Actual Damages
- §10:610 Form: Mitigation of Damages
- §10:620 Form: Liquidated Damages – Overview
- §10:630 Form: Willfulness Damages – Factors, Short Form
- §10:640 Form: Willfulness Damages – Factors, Long Form
- §10:641 Form: Tax Liability – Grossing Up

### **F. Verdict Forms**

- §10:650 Form: General Verdict
- §10:651 Form: Disparate Treatment
- §10:660 Form: Finding for Plaintiff – Willfulness
- §10:670 Form: Finding for Plaintiff
- §10:680 Form: Finding for Defendant

### **V. MISCELLANEOUS FORMS**

- §10:690 Form: Complaint – Age Discrimination – Retaliation

**§10:691 Form: Complaint – Age Discrimination – Termination – Title VII – ADEA – OWBPA – Breach of Severance Agreement**

**§10:692 Form: Demand for Jury Trial to Set Aside Arbitration Award**

**§10:700 Form: Plaintiff’s Rule 50 Motion for Pre-Verdict Judgment as a Matter of Law**

**§10:710 Form: Plaintiff’s Brief in Response and Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for a New Trial, Judgment Notwithstanding the Verdict or Relief From Judgment**

**§10:720 Form: EEOC Brief in Support of Petition for Rehearing *En Banc***

**§10:721 Form: Plaintiff’s Motion to Strike Affirmative Defenses**

## **CHAPTER 11. REPRESENTING MULTIPLE PLAINTIFFS**

### **I. REPRESENTING MULTIPLE PLAINTIFFS**

#### **§11:10 Introduction (*Wal-Mart Stores v. Dukes*)**

§11:10.10 Background

§11:10.20 Commonality Requirement for Class Certification Becomes More Demanding

§11:10.30 Rule 23(b)(2) Does Not Permit Class With Members Requesting Individual Relief

§11:10.40 *Dukes* Strengthens Defendants’ Hands in Class Actions

§11:10.50 Impact of the Decision

#### **§11:20 Advantages and Disadvantages of Multiple Representation**

§11:20.10 Advantages

§11:20.20 Disadvantages

§11:20.30 Limiting Representation to Administrative Stage

§11:20.40 Financing a Class Action

§11:20.50 Associating With Co-Counsel

#### **§11:30 Identifying Potential Plaintiffs**

§11:30.10 Consider the Impact of Releases

§11:30.20 OWBPA Eligible and Ineligible Employee List

§11:30.30 OWBPA as Tool to Challenge Releases

#### **§11:40 Cases Combining ADEA and Other Claims**

## **II. ADEA STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS FOR REPRESENTATIVE OR COLLECTIVE ACTIONS**

- §11:50 Governing Statutory Provisions**
  - §11:50.10 Statute of Limitations Issues
  - §11:50.20 How the Time Period Is Calculated
  - §11:50.30 Tolling of Time

**§11:60 [Reserved]**

## **III. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS**

**§11:70 Introduction**

**§11:80 Contents of Charge**

- §11:80.10 Class-Wide Claims

**§11:90 Who Should File EEOC Charge?**

- §11:90.10 Named Plaintiffs
- §11:90.20 Opt-In Plaintiffs: Single Filing Rule
  - §11:90.20.10 Opt-In's Claim Must Fall Within Time Period
  - §11:90.20.20 Charge Must Give Notice of Potential Class Claims

**§11:100 Effect of EEOC Treatment of Charge**

## **IV. COMPLAINT**

**§11:110 Designating Named Plaintiffs**

**§11:120 Defining the Class**

**§11:130 Statute of Limitations**

- §11:130.10 Named Plaintiffs
- §11:130.20 Opt-In Plaintiffs
- §11:130.30 Denial of Certification or Decertification

## **V. DEALING WITH COMPANION LITIGATION BY EEOC**

**§11:140 Introduction**

**§11:150 Working With EEOC to Avoid Cutting Off Opt-Ins' Rights**

**§11:160 Discovery Expenses**

**§11:170 Attorney's Fees**

## **VI. NOTICE AND OPT-IN PROCEDURE**

§11:180 Introduction

§11:190 Court-Approved Notice

§11:200 Authorization/”Conditional Certification” of Class for Notice

§11:210 Obtaining Names and Addresses for Notice

§11:220 Contents of Notice

§11:230 Contents of Consent Form

## **VII. AUTHORIZATION OF REPRESENTATIVE ACTION OR “CERTIFICATION” OF CLASS**

§11:240 Introduction

§11:250 Test for Determining Whether Class Members Are Similarly Situated

§11:250.10 Centralization of the Defendant’s Activities

§11:250.20 Similarities of the Potential Plaintiffs

§11:250.30 Common Claims and Defenses

§11:260 Dealing With the Decertification of an ADEA Collective Action

## **VIII. DISCOVERY IN ADEA REPRESENTATIVE OR COLLECTIVE ACTIONS**

§11:270 Discovery of Plaintiffs

§11:270.10 Named Plaintiffs

§11:270.20 Opt-In Plaintiffs

§11:270.30 Individual Damages

§11:280 Discovery of Defendants

§11:280.10 Electronic Information

§11:280.20 Consultants Used to Design a Reduction-in-Force or Work Force  
Restructuring

## **IX. PROVING DISCRIMINATION IN AN ADEA CLASS ACTION**

§11:290 Theories of Proof

§11:290.10 Disparate Treatment – Pattern and Practice Claims

§11:290.20 Disparate Impact

**§11:300 Statistical Evidence**

- §11:300.10 Controlling for the Employment Practice
- §11:300.20 Representative Sample
- §11:300.30 Adequate Sample Size
- §11:300.40 Sufficient Disparity
- §11:300.50 Bolster Statistics with Other Evidence

**§11:310 Resources on Class Actions**

**X. FORMS**

**§11:320 Impact Fund Application Form**

**§11:330 Notice to Potential Class Members**

**§11:340 Consent Form**

**§11:350 Memorandum to Certify a Collective Action**

**§11:360 Order Granting Notice, Notice & Consent Form**

**CHAPTER 12. SETTLEMENTS**

**I. OVERVIEW**

**§12:10 Introduction**

**II. SETTLEMENTS UNDER CIVIL RIGHTS STATUTES GENERALLY**

**§12:20 Waivers Must be “Knowing and Voluntary”**

- §12:20.10 Test: “Ordinary Contract Principles”
- §12:20.20 Test: “Totality of Circumstances”
- §12:20.30 Releases Executed by Unrepresented Claimants Before Litigation
- §12:20.40 Admissibility of Release and Settlement Agreements at Trial

**§12:30 Prospective Waivers – Invalid**

**§12:40 Class Action Settlements – Who is Covered?**

**§12:50 Waivers Prohibiting Cooperation With Other Employees Who Have Charges**

**III. SETTLEMENTS UNDER ADEA**

**§12:60 OWBPA – Regulations, Generally**

- §12:60.10 “Voluntary” Participation in Exit Program
- §12:60.20 Cost Justifications for Differing Employee Benefits

- §12:60.30 Severance and Disability Offsets
- §12:60.40 EEOC Requirements for “Knowing and Voluntary” Waiver
- §12:60.50 OWBPA Requirements for “Knowing and Voluntary” Waiver
  - §12:60.50.10 Must Be in Plain Language
  - §12:60.50.20 Must Refer to ADEA by Name
  - §12:60.50.30 Must Not Waive Future Rights
  - §12:60.50.40 Employee Must Receive Compensation in Addition to Anything to Which Already Entitled
  - §12:60.50.50 Consideration Does Not Mean Reinstating a Wrongfully Terminated Employee Benefit
  - §12:60.50.60 No Additional Consideration Requirement for Employees Over 40 if Terminated Pursuant to Program or Plan
  - §12:60.50.70 21/45 Days to Sign – Period Can be Waived
  - §12:60.50.80 Employee Must be Advised in Writing of Opportunity to Revoke Release Within Seven Days of Signing
  - §12:60.50.90 What Constitutes “Exit Incentive Program” or “Plan”?
  - §12:60.50.100 Broader Definition of “Decision-Making Unit”
  - §12:60.50.110 Waivers/Releases Cannot Effect EEOC Enforcement

**§12:70 Tender Back Rules**

- §12:70.10 Tender Back Rules Before *Oubre*
- §12:70.20 Tender Back After *Oubre*
  - §12:70.20.10 EEOC Regulations Following *Oubre*
  - §12:70.20.20 What Constitutes Knowing and Voluntary Release Under Proposed Regulation?
  - §12:70.20.30 Covenants Not To Challenge Release Are Invalid

**IV. WHAT TO LOOK FOR IN SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS**

**§12:80 Type and Scope of Release**

**§12:90 Entitlement to Benefits**

**§12:100 References**

**§12:110 Tax Aspects of Settlement**

- §12:110.10 IRS Audit Considerations
- §12:110.20 Case Law

**§12:120 Form: Separation and Release Agreement – Termination**

- §12:120.10 Form: Annotated Settlement Agreement
- §12:120.20 Form: Separation and Release Agreement – Short Form

**§12:130 Form: Confidential Settlement and General Release Agreement – State Human Rights Claim**

§12:140 **Form: Settlement Agreement and General Release – Employment Contract – Termination – Nondisclosure**

§12:150 **Form: Consent Decree – Reductions in Force**

## **V. MEDIATION**

§12:160 **Form: Plaintiff’s Confidential Mediation Brief**

## **CHAPTER 13. AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYEE BENEFITS**

### **I. OVERVIEW**

§13:10 **Introduction**

§13:20 **Background**

§13:20.10 **Benefit Plans**

§13:20.20 **Involuntary Retirement Prior to Age 70 Pursuant to Bona Fide Employee Benefit Plan**

§13:20.30 **Effect on Employee Benefit Plan**

§13:20.30.10 **General Principles**

§13:20.30.20 **Application to Particular Types of Plans**

§13:20.30.30 **Health Insurance**

§13:20.30.40 **Long-Term Disability Plans**

§13:20.30.50 **Retirement Plans**

### **II. EQUAL BENEFIT OR EQUAL COST STANDARD OF PROOF**

§13:30 ***Prima Facie* Case: Unequal Benefits**

§13:30.10 **Facially Discriminatory Plans State a Claim of Disparate Treatment**

§13:30.10.10 **Special Cases Involving Pension Status**

§13:30.20 **Evidence of Age-Based Motive or Animus Not Required**

§13:30.30 ***Hazen Paper* “Age-Proxy” Analysis Does Not Apply to Facially Discriminatory Benefit Plans**

§13:40 **Equal Cost Affirmative Defense**

### **III. EARLY RETIREMENT BENEFITS**

§13:50 **Introduction**

§13:60 **Minimum Eligibility Ages are Permissible**

**§13:70 Affirmative Defense: ERI Is Voluntary and Consistent With ADEA Purpose**

§13:70.10 Employer's Burden in Establishing ERI Defense

§13:70.20 Voluntariness

§13:70.30 Consistent With Purposes of ADEA

§13:70.30.10 Plans With Upper Age Limit on Eligibility

§13:70.30.20 Permissible Early Retirement Incentive Plans

**IV. PENSION BENEFITS**

**§13:80 Social Security Bridge Payments**

**§13:90 Pension Subsidies**

**§13:100 Age-Based Exclusions From Pension Plans**

§13:100.10 Under ADEA and OWBPA

§13:100.20 Under ERISA as Amended by Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act of 1986

**§13:110 Pension Credits and Accruals**

§13:110.10 Conversions to Cash Balance Plans

**§13:120 Pensions and Age 70 1/2 Payout Rule**

**V. SEVERANCE BENEFITS UNDER OWBPA**

**§13:130 Severance Benefits May Not Be Denied or Reduced Based on Pension Eligibility**

**§13:140 Severance Offset of Retiree Health or Pension Enhancements**

**VI. DISABILITY BENEFITS**

**§13:150 Overview**

**VII. HEALTH BENEFITS**

**§13:160 Overview**

§13:160.10 EEOC Policy

**VIII. PROCEDURAL ISSUES IN DISCRIMINATORY BENEFITS PLANS**

**§13:170 Timeliness**



§13:180 Ripeness and Standing

§13:190 Standing of Retirees

§13:200 Pre-OWBPA Series of Benefit Payments

§13:210 Whom to Name as Defendant in Benefits Suit?

## **IX. ERISA**

§13:220 Overview

§13:230 Scope of ERISA § 510 – Discharge, Discrimination, Interference and Retaliation

§13:240 Class Actions

§13:245 Qualified Retirement Plans

§13:250 Proving ERISA § 510 Claims

§13:260 Procedural Issues in ERISA § 510 Claims

§13:260.10 Standing

§13:260.20 Exhaustion Requirement

§13:260.30 Statute of Limitations

§13:260.40 Jury Trial

§13:260.50 *Res Judicata*

§13:260.60 Preemption of Wrongful Discharge Action

## **CHAPTER 14. WORK FORCE RESTRUCTURING, DOWNSIZING, AND REDUCTIONS IN FORCE**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

§14:10 Overview

§14:20 Scope

### **II. DETERMINE WHETHER FACTS PRESENT RIF CASE**

§14:30 Reduction in Force Defined

§14:31 RIFs Under the ADEA

§14:31.10 Generally

§14:31.20 Conduct Prohibited by the ADEA

- §14:31.30 ADEA Standards in RIF Cases
  - §14:31.30.10 Direct Evidence of Age Discrimination
  - §14:31.30.20 Indirect Evidence of Age Discrimination: Disparate Treatment
  - §14:31.30.30 RIF *Prima Facie* Case: Disparate Treatment
  - §14:31.30.40 Proof of Discriminatory Intent/Pretext: Disparate Treatment
  - §14:31.30.50 Mixed Motives
  - §14:31.30.60 Indirect Evidence of Age Discrimination: Disparate Impact
  - §14:31.30.70 Wage Discrimination

**§14:40 Plaintiff Strategy**

**III. IDENTIFY CLAIMS TO RAISE**

**§14:50 Termination, Failure to Hire or Transfer**

**§14:60 Constructive Discharge**

**§14:70 ERISA §510**

**IV. EXAMINE RIF PROCESS FOR DISCRIMINATION EVIDENCE**

**§14:80 Overview**

**§14:90 Consider Employer's Use of Subjective Criteria in Selection**

**§14:100 Use OWBPA to Obtain Age Data and Other Information**

- §14:100.10 What "Program" Triggers Information Disclosure?
  - §14:100.10.10 "Group" Programs
  - §14:100.10.20 Standardized Benefits Package
  - §14:100.10.30 Disclosure Applies to Involuntary and Voluntary Programs
- §14:100.20 Information to Be Disclosed
  - §14:100.20.10 Ages of All Employees
  - §14:100.20.20 Job Titles
  - §14:100.20.30 Same Job Classification or Organizational Unit
- §14:100.30 Using OWBPA Data

**§14:110 Determine if Employees' Ages Were Included in Termination Materials**

**§14:120 Consult Human Resource Literature about RIF Standards and Processes**

**V. FILE TIMELY CHARGE OF DISCRIMINATION**

**§14:130 Overview**

**§14:140 Determine Starting Date for Running of Charge Filing Period**

## **VI. PROVING AGE DISCRIMINATION IN A RIF**

### **§14:150 Overview**

§14:150.10 Disparate Impact Claims in RIF Cases

### **§14:160 *Prima Facie* Case**

§14:160.10 Plaintiff Performing According to Employer's Expectations

§14:160.20 Varying Formulations for the Fourth Element of *Prima Facie* Case

§14:160.20.10 Comparing Treatment of Older and Younger Employees

§14:160.20.20 "Additional" Evidence That Age Was a Factor

§14:160.20.30 "Substantially Younger" Employee?

§14:160.20.40 "Similarly Situated" Employees?

§14:160.20.50 Examining Who Was Retained

§14:160.30 Facts Applicable to Fourth Element of *Prima Facie* Case

§14:160.30.10 When Younger Employee Assumes Plaintiff's Duties

§14:160.30.20 Opportunity to Transfer

§14:160.40 Consider All Evidence Relevant to RIF

§14:160.40.10 Transfers Precipitating Layoffs

§14:160.40.20 Evidence About Potential Retirement

## **VII. EMPLOYER'S BURDEN OF PRODUCTION**

### **§14:170 RIF and its Criteria are Nondiscriminatory**

### **§14:180 Defendant's Business Judgment**

## **VIII. PROVING PRETEXT IN RIF CASES**

### **§14:190 Pretext**

§14:190.10 Inconsistent Application of RIF Criteria or RIF Process

§14:190.20 Evidence That RIF Is Pretextual

§14:190.20.10 Hirings

§14:190.20.10a Pre-RIF Hirings

§14:190.20.10b Post-RIF Hiring

§14:190.20.20 Transfers After or in Place of RIF

§14:190.20.30 Dangers of Attacking Economic Necessity of RIF

§14:190.30 Inconsistent Reasons for Plaintiff's Treatment by Employer

§14:190.40 Casting Doubt on Employer's Reasons

§14:190.50 Attacking Defendant's "RIF Expert"

§14:190.50.10 Form: Motion *in Limine* to Exclude Defendant's RIF Expert

§14:190.60 Qualifications Evidence/Performance Evaluations

### **§14:200 Use Statistical Evidence to Prove Age Discrimination**

§14:200.10 Qualities That Make Statistical Evidence Relevant and Meaningful

§14:200.10.10 Adequate Sample Size

§14:200.10.20 Comparison of Similarly Situated Employees

- §14:200.20 Using Statistics to Demonstrate Pretext
- §14:200.30 Using Age Data Separate From Statistical Presentation

**§14:210 Use Ageist Comments to Show Pretext**

- §14:210.10 Statements by Decisionmakers
- §14:210.20 Statements by Non-Decisionmakers
- §14:210.30 Statements Evidencing Ageist Corporate Culture
- §14:210.40 Does Comment Reflect Ageist Animus?

**§14:220 Attack “Same Actor” Defense Argument for an Inference of No Discrimination**

**IX. REVIEW AVAILABLE REMEDIES**

**§14:230 Overview**

**§14:240 Remedies at Trial**

- §14:240.10 Reinstatement
- §14:240.20 Front Pay
- §14:240.30 Liquidated Damages

**§14:250 Remedies Pursuant to Consent Decree**

**X. APPENDIX**

**§14:260 Model Reduction-in-Force Process**

**XI. FORM**

**§14:270 Plaintiff’s Response to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment in a RIF Case**

**CHAPTER 15. ATTORNEY’S FEES AND COSTS**

**I. INTRODUCTION**

**§15:10 Statutory Authority**

- §15:10.10 Statutory Background
- §15:10.20 General Overview
- §15:10.30 Upward Adjustment
- §15:10.40 Representation Agreement

**§15:20 Purpose of Fee-Shifting Statutes**

## **II. PARTIES ENTITLED TO FEES UNDER ADEA**

### **A. Parties Who May Recover Fees**

§15:30 “Prevailing” Plaintiffs

§15:40 Attorneys in Public Interest Organizations and Unions

§15:50 Federal Employees as ADEA Plaintiffs

### **B. Parties Who May Not Recover Fees**

§15:60 Defendants

§15:60.10 Defendants Cannot Recover Fees Under ADEA

§15:60.20 Defendants May be Able to Recover Under the American Rule

§15:60.20.10 Standard for Bad Faith

§15:60.20.20 Specific Findings by Court

§15:60.20.30 Plaintiff’s Opposition to a Defendant’s Fee Petition

§15:60.30 Defendants May Also Seek Fees Under FRCP 38

§15:70 EEOC

§15:80 Attorneys as ADEA Plaintiffs

§15:90 Summary

## **III. CALCULATING FEES**

§15:100 *Johnson v. Georgia Highway Express*

§15:110 Lodestar Method

## **IV. DETERMINING REASONABLE HOURLY RATES**

### **A. Prevailing Market Rate**

§15:120 Attorney’s Billing Rate

§15:130 Recent Awards

§15:140 Affidavits of Attorneys Regarding Community Billing Rate

§15:150 Defense Counsel’s Rates

**§15:160 Court's Establishment of Rate When Documentation Inadequate**

§15:160.10 Skill, Experience, and Reputation of Counsel

§15:160.20 Complexity of Case

**B. Factors in Determining Appropriate Rate**

§15:170 Actual versus Market Rates

§15:180 Flat versus Variable Rates

§15:190 Current versus Historical Rates

**C. Establishing Relevant Community**

§15:200 Introduction

§15:210 Forum Approach

§15:220 Out-of-Town Rates

§15:220.10 The Laffey Matrix Method

**V. COMPENSABLE ACTIVITIES**

**A. Representation Prior to Litigation**

§15:230 Administrative Proceedings

§15:240 Arbitration Proceedings

**B. Compensable Activities During Litigation**

§15:250 Organizing Files

§15:260 Conducting Mock Trial

§15:270 Fees Incurred After a Rule 68 Offer of Judgment Has Been Made

§15:280 Post-Trial Motions

§15:280.10 Enforcement Actions

§15:290 Litigating Fees

§15:300 Appellate Time

§15:310 Support Personnel

§15:320 Out-of-Pocket Expenses

**C. Non-Compensable Activities**

§15:330 Media or Public Relations Work

§15:340 Expert Fees Are Not Recoverable Under ADEA

**VI. REASONABLENESS OF HOURS EXPENDED**

§15:350 Introduction

§15:360 Billing Judgment

§15:360.10 Reasonably Staffing Case

§15:360.20 Avoid Duplicative Attorney Efforts

§15:360.30 Comparing Adversary's Hours and Conduct

**VII. RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DAMAGES AWARDED AND FEES SOUGHT**

§15:370 No Ceiling on Amount of Fees To be Recovered

§15:380 Entitlement to Higher of Contingent Fee or Court-Awarded Fee

§15:390 Relationship of Settlement Proposal to Damages Award

**VIII. ADJUSTMENTS TO LODESTAR**

**A. Overview**

§15:400 Introduction

**B. Upward Adjustments**

§15:410 Introduction

§15:420 Enhancements for Delays in Payment

§15:430 Enhancements for Exceptional Success

§15:440 Impermissible Adjustments

§15:450 Contingent Fee Cases

**C. Downward Adjustments**

§15:460 Introduction

§15:470 Unsuccessful Unrelated Claims

§15:480 Unsuccessful Related Claims

§15:480.10 Common Core of Facts

§15:480.20 Related Legal Theories

§15:490 Inappropriate Bases for Adjusting the Lodestar Downward

**D. Significance of Overall Relief Obtained**

§15:500 Excellent Results

§15:510 Partial or Limited Success

§15:520 Nominal Damages or *De Minimis* Recovery

**IX. COSTS**

**A. Recoverable Costs**

§15:530 Costs Under ADEA

**B. Rule 54(d) Costs**

§15:540 Introduction

§15:550 Transcripts

§15:560 Copies

§15:570 Expert Witness Fees

§15:580 Costs Not Recoverable

§15:590 Costs to Prevailing Defendant

**X. INTEREST ON FEE AWARD**

§15:600 Introduction



**XI. TAXATION OF ATTORNEY'S FEES**

§15:610 Introduction

**XII. GUIDELINES FOR SEEKING AND RECOVERING FEES**

**A. Establishing Basis for Fees Throughout Litigation**

§15:620 Introduction

§15:630 Covering Fee Issues in Retainer Agreement

§15:640 Keeping Contemporaneous Time Records

§15:650 Structuring and Conducting the Case With Fees and Costs in Mind

§15:650.10 Deciding Which Claims to Pursue

§15:650.20 Dealing With Defense Counsel

§15:650.30 Dealing With Court

§15:650.40 Billing Judgment

**B. Filing Your Petition For Fees**

§15:660 When to File

§15:670 Counsel's Burden to Establish Hourly Rate

§15:680 Petitioning Counsel's Affidavit

§15:690 Motion Requesting Attorney's Fees

§15:700 Fee Petition

§15:710 Supplemental Fee Requests

**C. Appealing Fee Issues**

§15:720 Introduction

**XIII. PRESERVING FEES WHEN EEOC IS INVOLVED IN LITIGATION**

§15:730 Introduction

**XIV. CHECKLIST FOR FEE PETITION**

§15:740 Checklist

**XV. FORMS**

§15:750 Affidavit of Lead Counsel

§15:760 Affidavits of Supporting Counsel

§15:770 Affidavit of Plaintiff

§15:780 Memorandum in Support of Attorney's Fees and Costs

§15:790 Memorandum in Opposition To Defendant's Petition for Fees and Costs

**APPENDIX A**

NELA Amicus Brief, *Smith v. City of Jackson*

**APPENDIX B**

NELA, AARP Amicus Brief — *Meacham v. Knolls Atomic Power Laboratory*.

**APPENDIX C**

“Top Ten” Tips to Make Your Case More Summary Judgment Resistant

**TABLE OF CASES**

**INDEX**

L. Steven Platt  
Cathy Ventrell-Monsees

---

# Age Discrimination Litigation

---

Volume 2



Contact us at (800) 440-4780 or [www.jamespublishing.com](http://www.jamespublishing.com)

(Rev. 12, 5/12)

## AGE DISCRIMINATION LITIGATION

---

Copyright © 2012 James Publishing, Inc.

ISBN 1-58012-058-X

This publication is intended to provide accurate and authoritative information about the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher does not render legal or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, seek the services of a competent professional.

Persons using this publication in dealing with specific legal matters should exercise their own independent judgment and research original sources of authority and local court rules.

The publisher and the authors make no representations concerning the contents of this publication and disclaim any warranties or merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose.

**Caveat:** View the jury instructions in this book as model instructions only. They are not intended to be used verbatim in every case. The law changes rapidly in age discrimination and you must conduct independent legal research when preparing jury instructions. Also, you will achieve the best success by tailoring the language of the instructions to match the complaint, evidence, and particular issues at hand.

We view the publication of this work as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic revisions will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggested changes. Call us at (714) 755-5450 or send your comments to:

Managing Editor  
James Publishing, Inc.  
3505 Cadillac Ave., Suite H  
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

First Edition, 6/00  
Revision 1, 7/01  
Revision 2, 5/02  
Revision 3, 9/03  
Revision 4, 8/04  
Revision 5, 9/05  
Revision 6, 7/06  
Revision 7, 8/07  
Revision 8, 10/08  
Revision 9, 8/09  
Revision 10, 8/10  
Revision 11, 7/11  
Revision 12, 5/12

### **STAFF**

Managing Editor: Lisa J. Dunne, Esq.  
Production Editor: Adam Pringle  
Production Manager: Amanda Winkler

## AUTHORS



**Cathy Ventrell-Monsees** has litigated ADEA cases for 29 years, including several ADEA class actions, and she has written more than 50 amicus briefs in the U.S. Supreme Court and circuit courts. For thirteen years, she directed an age discrimination litigation project at AARP. She is currently an attorney advisor to Commissioner Stuart Ishimaru at the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. From 2007-2010, she led Workplace Fairness as its president and served on its Board of Directors beginning in 2000. She served on the Board of Directors of the National Employment Lawyers Association from 1996-2008. She served as an employee representative on the Council of the ABA Labor and Employment Section from 1998-2002 and was co-chair of its EEO Committee from 1994-1997. She is an associate editor for the 1998

*Supplement to Employment Discrimination Law* (3d Ed.). She teaches employment discrimination law at the Washington College of Law at American University and frequently appears in the media and at conferences as an expert on age discrimination issues.

**L. Steven Platt** has litigated ADEA cases for 34 years. He has tried over 100 cases to verdict in Federal District Courts and state courts and has handled cases, appeals and amicus briefs in jurisdictions ranging from California to New York. He was elected a “Fellow” in the American College of Labor and Employment Lawyers, was the three-time Chair of the Chicago Bar Association Civil Rights Committee, is a member of the adjunct faculty of labor and employment attorneys with the Illinois Institute of Continuing Education, and was one of 18 people selected by the EEOC to participate in the negotiated rulemaking that led to the regulations adopted by the EEOC under the Older Workers Benefit Protection Act. He is also the Plaintiff/Public National Liaison, EEO Agency Liaison, and National Legislative Liaison Co-Chair of the ABA Labor and Employment EEO Committee. He has served as President of the National Employment Lawyers Association, a 3,500 member national employment lawyers group, and as President of Workplace Fairness, an organization dedicated to educating workers about their rights.



**CONTRIBUTORS**

Raymond C. Fay  
Bell, Boyd & Lloyd  
Washington, DC

Laurie A. McCann  
AARP Foundation Litigation  
Washington, DC

Katie Eyers  
Salmanson Goldshaw, P.C.  
Philadelphia, PA

Stephanie E. Trudeau  
Ulmer & Berne LLP  
Cleveland, OH

Steven Z. Chertkof  
Heller, Huron, Chertkof, Lerner,  
Simon & Salzman, PLLC  
Washington, DC

Harris D. Butler, III  
Butler, Williams & Skilling, P.C.  
Richmond, VA

Susan M. Coler  
Sprenger & Lang, PLLC  
Minneapolis, MN

**ADVISORY BOARD MEMBERS**

Frederick M. Gittes  
Spater, Gittes, Schulte & Kolman  
Columbus, OH

Laurie A. McCann  
Staff Attorney  
AARP Foundation Litigation  
Washington, DC

Glen D. Savits  
Lucas Savits & Marose  
West Orange, NJ

Evelyn J. Marose  
Lucas Savits & Marose  
West Orange, NJ

Tomas W. Osborne  
Staff Attorney  
AARP Foundation Litigation  
Washington, D.C.

Darlene A. Vorachek  
Abrahamson Vorachek & Mikva  
Chicago, IL

**DEDICATION**

We would like to thank the following attorneys for their generous contributions to this book:

Ray Fay, Bell, Boyd & Lloyd  
Washington, DC

Fred Gittes, Gittes & Schulte  
Columbus, OH

David L. Lee, Law Offices of David L. Lee,  
Chicago, IL

Laurie McCann, AARP Foundation Litigation  
Washington, D.C.

Robin Potter  
Chicago, Illinois

Darlene Vorachek, Abrahamson, Vorachek & Mikva  
Chicago, IL

John David Weiss, Law Offices of John D. Weiss,  
Encino, CA

Susan M. Cole, Sprenger & Lang, PLLC  
Minneapolis, MN

L. Steven Platt

Cathy Ventrell-Monsees

**SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**CHAPTER 1. THE LAW**

**CHAPTER 2. CLIENT INTAKE AND INVESTIGATION OF CLAIMS**

**CHAPTER 3. FILING SUIT**

**CHAPTER 4. DISCOVERY**

**CHAPTER 5. PROVING AGE DISCRIMINATION**

**CHAPTER 6. REMEDIES AVAILABLE UNDER ADEA**

**CHAPTER 7. SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

**CHAPTER 8. HOW YOUR OPPONENT MAY TRY TO LIMIT YOUR EVIDENCE**

**CHAPTER 9. USING EXPERTS IN AGE DISCRIMINATION CASES**

**CHAPTER 10. TRIAL**

**CHAPTER 11. REPRESENTING MULTIPLE PLAINTIFFS**

**CHAPTER 12. SETTLEMENTS**

**CHAPTER 13. AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYEE BENEFITS**

**CHAPTER 14. WORK FORCE RESTRUCTURING, DOWNSIZING,  
AND REDUCTIONS IN FORCE**

**CHAPTER 15. ATTORNEY'S FEES AND COSTS**

**APPENDIX A**

**APPENDIX B**

**APPENDIX C**

**TABLE OF CASES**

**INDEX**



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 1. THE LAW

### I. INTRODUCTION – INCREASING TREND IN CHARGES CONTINUES

#### §1:10 Impact of Baby Boomers

§1:11 Recent Trends

#### §1:20 Social and Economic Cost

#### §1:30 Historical Overview: Impact of Secretary of Labor’s Report

#### §1:40 Comparing ADEA and Title VII

§1:40.10 Coverage and Procedural Differences

§1:40.20 Differences in Methods of Proof

§1:40.30 ADEA Employer Defenses Not Found in Title VII

§1:40.40 Differences in Remedies Between ADEA and Title VII

#### §1:50 ADEA Enforced by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

### II. WHO IS COVERED?

#### §1:60 Generally

#### §1:70 “Employer” Defined

§1:70.10 General

§1:70.10.10 Parent Companies and Subsidiaries

§1:70.10.20 Supervisors and Managers

§1:70.20 States, Political Subdivisions, Legislative Bodies

§1:70.20.10 General

§1:70.20.20 Sovereign Immunity Issues

§1:70.20.30 Municipal Employers Still Subject to Private ADEA Suits for Damages

§1:70.20.40 EEOC May Sue State Employers for Damages Under ADEA

§1:70.20.50 State Licensing and Regulatory Agencies

§1:70.20.60 No §1983 Claim for Personal Liability

§1:70.30 Federal Employees

§1:70.40 Foreign Employers, Foreign Decision Making and Work Stations

§1:70.50 Labor Unions and Organizations

§1:70.60 Employment Agencies

§1:70.70 Agents

§1:70.80 Religious Organizations

§1:70.90 Membership Organizations and Associations

#### §1:80 “Employee” Defined

§1:80.10 General

§1:80.20 Independent Contractors

- §1:80.30 Partners
- §1:80.40 Shareholders and Owners
- §1:80.50 Physicians
- §1:80.60 Personal Staff Exemption
- §1:80.70 Military Employees

**§1:90 Venue**

**III. ACTS PROHIBITED**

**§1:100 Adverse Actions**

**§1:110 Favoring Older Employees Not Prohibited**

**§1:120 Advertising**

**§1:130 Reductions in Force (RIFs)**

**§1:140 Constructive Discharge**

- §1:140.10 Generally
- §1:140.20 Harassment

**§1:150 Forced Retirement**

- §1:150.10 Generally
- §1:150.20 Exceptions

**§1:160 Demotions**

**§1:170 Negative Evaluations After Years of Good Performance**

**§1:180 Exclusion From Training and Threatened Long Work Hours**

**§1:190 When Plaintiff Is Offered “Choice”**

**§1:200 Time to Consider Options**

**§1:210 Threatened Loss of Retirement Benefits if Early Retirement Not Selected**

**§1:220 Forced Transfers**

**§1:230 Refusal of Transfers**

**§1:240 Hostile Work Environment**

**§1:250 Labor Organizations/Apprenticeship Programs**

- §1:250.10 Labor Organizations
- §1:250.20 Union Apprenticeship Programs & BFOQ Defense

**IV. TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT**

§1:260 Generally

§1:270 Reduced Hours, Denial of Overtime and Work Assignments

§1:280 Differences in Pay

§1:290 Offsetting Severance Pay Due to Retirement Benefits

§1:300 Elimination of Seniority

**V. EMPLOYER RETALIATION**

§1:310 In General

§1:320 ADEA Follows Title VII Pattern of Proof

§1:320.10 Cases Applying Title VII Formula to ADEA Retaliation Claims

§1:320.20 Cases Holding Reasonable Belief Establishes Claim

§1:330 Two Types of Protected Activity

§1:330.10 Facilitating ADEA Enforcement

§1:330.20 Opposing Employer's Discriminatory Practices

§1:340 What Constitutes "Adverse Action"

§1:340.10 Examples of Adverse Action

§1:340.20 Mere Inconvenience Not Actionable

§1:350 What Constitutes "Causation"

§1:350.10 "Causal Link"

§1:350.20 Proximity in Time

§1:360 Retaliation Remedies

§1:360.10 Form: Motion for Preliminary Injunction Reinstating Plaintiff to Maintain Status Quo

**VI. EMPLOYER DEFENSES**

§1:370 Bona Fide Occupational Qualification (BFOQ)

§1:380 Two-Pronged Test

§1:390 Maximum Hiring Ages

§1:400 Reasonable Factors Other Than Age

§1:410 Seniority Systems and Employee Benefit Plan Exceptions

§1:420 Foreign Workplace Defense

## **VII. MANDATORY ARBITRATION**

§1:430 The *Circuit City* Case

§1:440 Checklist to Attack Arbitration Agreements

§1:450 Form: Brief to Resist Mandatory Arbitration

## **CHAPTER 2. CLIENT INTAKE AND INVESTIGATION OF CLAIMS**

### **I. INITIAL CLIENT INTERVIEW**

§2:10 Telephone Interview

§2:20 In-Person Interview

§2:30 Special Questions for Reduction-in-Force Claims

§2:40 How to Recognize a Claim – Basic Evidence

§2:40.10 *Prima Facie* Case

§2:40.20 Plaintiff's Burden

§2:40.30 Direct Evidence

§2:40.40 Direct Evidence Method

§2:40.50 Employer's Pretext for Discrimination

§2:50 Form: Intake Questionnaire

### **II. RETAINER AGREEMENTS**

§2:60 Introduction

§2:70 Drafting Considerations

§2:70.10 Case Law

### **III. FORM**

§2:80 Retainer Agreement, Initial Client Review

## **CHAPTER 3. FILING SUIT**

### **I. ADMINISTRATIVE PREREQUISITES**

#### **A. Statutory Requirements**

**§3:10 Charge Filing Required**

**§3:20 Adherence to Deadlines**

#### **B. Charge-Filing Deadlines**

**§3:30 Background**

**§3:40 Determining Proper Deadline**

§3:40.10 300-Day States

§3:40.10.10 Filing With FEP Agency

§3:40.10.20 Filing With EEOC

§3:40.20 180-Day States

**§3:50 Actual Date of Charge Filing**

§3:50.10 Tips for Attorney-Drafted Charges

#### **C. Starting Point of Filing Period**

**§3:60 Date Unlawful Employment Practice Occurred**

§3:60.10 Notice of Act or Discrimination

§3:60.10.10 Accrual Date

§3:60.10.20 Discovery Rule

§3:60.20 Unequivocal Notice

§3:60.30 Other Facts Triggering Filing Period

§3:60.40 Constructive Discharge Claims

§3:60.50 Pay or Compensation Claims

**§3:70 Discriminatory Policies, Seniority Systems, and Benefit Plans**

§3:70.10 Facially Discriminatory Policies and Plans

§3:70.20 Neutral Policies and Plans

§3:70.30 Older Workers Benefit Protection Act

**§3:80 ERISA Method**

**§3:90 Harassment, Systemic, or Pattern and Practice Claims**

§3:90.10 Consequences of Time-Barred Discriminatory Acts

## **D. Actions After Clock Starts**

### **§3:100 Clock Stops**

- §3:100.10 Equitable Tolling vs. Equitable Estoppel
- §3:100.20 Equitable Tolling
- §3:100.30 Equitable Estoppel
  - §3:100.30.10 Employer's Failure to Post ADEA §8 Notice
  - §3:100.30.20 Employer Misconduct/Misrepresentations

## **E. Form and Contents of Charge**

### **§3:110 Overview**

### **§3:120 Form of the "Charge" – Oral Communication, Letter, Intake Questionnaire or EEOC Form 5**

- §3:120.10 Form: EEOC Form 5

### **§3:130 Content**

### **§3:140 Scope**

## **F. Filing Charge**

### **§3:150 Who Can File**

- §3:150.10 Single Filing Rule
- §3:150.20 Calculating Filing Period of Claims Covered by Single Filing Rule
- §3:150.30 Employees Working for Companies Outside United States

## **II. DEALING EFFECTIVELY WITH EEOC**

### **A. Charge Prioritization System of EEOC**

#### **§3:160 Overview**

#### **§3:170 Category A: Enforcement Plan/Potential Cause Charges**

#### **§3:180 Category B: Charges Requiring Additional Information**

#### **§3:190 Category C: Charges Suitable for Dismissal**

### **B. EEOC's Enforcement Plans**

#### **§3:200 Overview**

#### **§3:210 National Enforcement Plan**

#### **§3:220 Local Enforcement Plans**

**C. Initial Charge Processing**

§3:230 EEOC Counseling

§3:240 Communicating With EEOC

**D. Charge Determinations by EEOC**

§3:250 Dismissals and Notices of Right to Sue

§3:260 Cause Determinations

§3:270 Attempts to Settle Charge

**E. Prerequisites to Filing Lawsuit**

§3:280 Steps Prior to Filing

§3:290 60-Day Rule – Early Filing of Lawsuit

§3:290.10 No “Right-to-Sue” Letter Needed to File Suit

§3:290.20 Administrative Exhaustion Is Not a Jurisdictional Prerequisite to Suit

§3:300 Simultaneous Filing

§3:310 60 Days from Last Filing

§3:320 60 Days for EEOC Conciliation

§3:330 90-Day Rule for Filing Suit

§3:340 Determinations by State FEP Agency

§3:350 EEOC Investigation and Litigation: Absent a Charge

§3:360 EEOC Litigation Precludes Private Suits

**F. Checklists**

§3:370 Charge-Filing Checklist

§3:380 Date and Deadline Checklist

**G. Federal Employees**

§3:390 Federal Charge Procedures

§3:390.10 First Step: Contact Federal EEO Counselor

§3:390.20 Mandatory “EEO Counseling”

- §3:390.30 “Voluntary” Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR)
- §3:390.40 Filing a Charge
- §3:390.50 Dismissal of Charge
- §3:390.60 How Investigations Are Handled
- §3:390.70 Method of Investigation
- §3:390.80 Conduct of Administrative Hearings
- §3:390.90 Contents of the Complaint File
- §3:390.100 Final Decision by the Agency
- §3:390.110 Appeal of ALJ Decision to Office of Federal Operations
- §3:390.120 Filing an “Appeal” as a Lawsuit in Federal Court
- §3:390.130 Federal Employee Class Actions
- §3:390.140 Grievances as Civil Rights Actions
- §3:390.150 Mixed Case Complaints

### **III. FILING AN ADEA LAWSUIT IN FEDERAL COURT**

#### **§3:400 Jurisdictional Prerequisites**

#### **§3:410 Venue, Jurisdiction**

#### **§3:420 Parties**

#### **§3:430 Factual Allegations**

#### **§3:440 Damages**

#### **§3:450 Forms**

- §3:450.10 Form: Sample Complaint – ADEA Lawsuit
- §3:450.20 Form: Class Action ADEA Complaint – Annotated
- §3:450.30 Form: Complaint – ADEA Willful; Non-Willful

## **CHAPTER 4. DISCOVERY**

### **I. OVERVIEW DISCOVERY STRATEGY**

#### **§4:10 Proving a *Prima Facie* Case**

- §4:10.10 How Comprehensive Can Discovery Be?

#### **§4:20 Pretext**

### **II. DOCUMENT REQUESTS**

#### **§4:25 Pre-Filing Discovery Request**

- §4:25.10 Form: Motion for Expedited Discovery and Preservation



**§4:30 Generally**

§4:30.10 Form: Plaintiff's Rule 26 Disclosures

§4:30.20 Form: Complainant's Initial Document Requests to Respondent

**§4:40 Plaintiff's Checklist**

**§4:50 Defendant's Checklist**

**§4:60 Forms: Request for Production of Documents – Termination**

§4:60.10 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Termination of Sales Representative – Age Discrimination/Retaliation

§4:60.20 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Termination – Administrative Assistant

§4:60.30 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Termination; Failure to Promote

**§4:70 Forms: Request for Production of Documents – Failure to Hire**

§4:70.10 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Failure to Hire

§4:70.20 Form: Request for Production of Documents – Failure to Hire

**§4:80 Forms: Request for Production of Documents – State Human Rights Commission**

§4:80.10 Form: Request for Production of Documents – State Human Rights Commission – Termination

§4:80.20 Form: Request for Production of Documents – State Human Rights Commission – Termination – Longer Version

§4:80.30 Form: Complainant's First Set of Requests for Production of Documents – RIF

**§4:90 Form: Plaintiff's Request for Production of Documents – Electronic Discovery**

**§4:110 [Reserved]**

**§4:120 Form: Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's Document Request**

**III. INTERROGATORIES**

**§4:130 Generally**

**§4:140 Plaintiff's Approach**

**§4:150 Plaintiff's Checklist**

§4:151 Investigatory, Contention and Occurrence Interrogatories

§4:151.10 Investigatory

§4:151.20 Contention

§4:151.30 Occurrence

**§4:160 Expert Witness Checklist**

**§4:170 Defendant's Checklist**

**§4:180 Forms: Interrogatories – Termination of Employee**

§4:180.10 Form: Interrogatories – Termination of Employee; Failure to Promote

§4:180.20 Form: Interrogatories to Defendant – Federal Court – Termination; RIF

§4:180.30 Form: Complainant's Interrogatories to Respondent – Age/Disability  
Discrimination

**§4:190 Form: Interrogatories – Failure to Hire**

**§4:200 Form: Interrogatories – Failure to Promote**

§4:200.10 Form: Interrogatories – Plaintiff's First Set to Defendant –  
Failure to Promote

**§4:210 Form: Interrogatories – Demotion/Termination**

**§4:220 Form: Interrogatories – To Defendant's Experts**

**§4:230 Forms: Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Interrogatories**

§4:230.10 Form: Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Interrogatories – Termination/  
Retaliation – Intentional and Reckless

§4:230.20 Form: Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Interrogatories – Termination;  
Failure to Promote

§4:230.30 Form: Plaintiff's Responses and Objections to First Set of  
Interrogatories – Termination – RIF

**§4:240 Forms: Interrogatories – State Human Rights Commission**

§4:241 Form: Interrogatories – State Human Rights Commission –  
Demotion/Failure to Promote

§4:242 Form: Interrogatories – Termination – Discriminatory Comments –  
State Human Rights Commission

§4:243 Form: Interrogatories – RIF – State Human Rights Commission

§4:244 Form: Interrogatories to Complainant – RIF – State Human Rights  
Commission

§4:245 Form: Supplemental Interrogatories to Complainant – RIF – State Human  
Rights Commission

**§4:250 [Reserved]**

**IV. REQUESTS TO ADMIT**

**§4:260 Generally**

**§4:270 Plaintiff Checklist**

**§4:280 Forms: Requests for Admissions**

§4:281 Form: Plaintiff's Requests for Admissions – Termination

§4:282 Form: Plaintiff's Requests for Admissions – Failure to Hire/Promote

- §4:283 Form: Plaintiff's First Request for Admissions
- §4:284 Form: Complainant's First Request for Admissions – RIF – State Human Rights Commission
- §4:285 Form: Complainant's Requests to Admit – Age/Disability Discrimination

## **V. DEPOSITIONS**

### **§4:300 Generally**

### **§4:310 Objective of Deposition**

### **§4:320 Who to Depose**

### **§4:330 Plaintiff's Pre-Deposition Checklist**

- §4:330.10 Form: Notice of Deposition

### **§4:340 Plaintiff's Deposition Preparation**

- §4:340.10 Review Documents With Plaintiff Prior to Plaintiff's Deposition
- §4:340.20 Discuss Process and Questions With Plaintiff in Preparation for Plaintiff's Deposition
- §4:340.30 Defense Strategy in Deposing Plaintiff
- §4:340.40 Plaintiff Strategy in Deposing Defense Witnesses
- §4:340.50 General Deposition Rules

## **VI. EXPERT WITNESSES**

### **§4:350 Statistical Experts**

### **§4:360 Damages Experts**

### **§4:370 Psychotherapists**

### **§4:380 Vocational Experts**

## **VII. PROTECTIVE ORDERS**

### **§4:390 Access to Non-Party Files**

- §4:390.10 Protective Orders Regarding Chief Operating Officers

## **VIII. DISCOVERY MOTIONS**

### **§4:400 Motions to Compel Production**

### **§4:410 Form: Plaintiff's Motion to Compel Defendant's Rule 26(a)(1) Disclosures**

## **CHAPTER 5. PROVING AGE DISCRIMINATION**

### **I. GENERAL METHODS OF PROOF**

#### **A. Introduction**

§5:10 ADEA Prohibitions

§5:20 Overview

§5:30 Pleading Requirements

### **II. DISPARATE TREATMENT**

§5:40 Direct vs. Indirect Methods of Proving Disparate Treatment

#### **A. Direct Method of Proof**

§5:50 Definition of Direct Evidence

§5:60 Types of Direct Evidence

§5:60.10 Facially Discriminatory Plans and Policies

§5:60.20 Factors Inextricably Linked to Age

§5:60.30 Age Consciousness

§5:60.40 Ageist Statements Constituting Direct Evidence

§5:70 Circumstantial Evidence Under the Direct Method of Proof

§5:80 Types of Circumstantial Evidence Under the Direct Method of Proof

§5:80.10 Ageist Comments as Circumstantial Evidence

§5:80.20 Comparative Evidence—Disparate Treatment of Similarly Situated Employees

§5:80.30 Employer's Failure to Follow Corporate Policies or Procedures

#### **B. Indirect Method of Proof**

§5:90 *McDonnell Douglas* Indirect Proof Method

§5:90.10 *McDonnell Douglas* Framework Still Applies After *Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.*

§5:90.10.10 Courts Applying *McDonnell Douglas* Framework After *Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.*

§5:90.10.20 Courts Modifying *McDonnell Douglas* Framework and Imposing Heightened Standards of Proof After *Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.*

§5:90.20 Courts Err in Rigid Adherence to *McDonnell Douglas*

**§5:100 *Prima Facie* Case**

- §5:100.10 Plaintiff Sought the Position
- §5:100.20 Position Is Vacant
- §5:100.30 Plaintiff Is Qualified/Performing Satisfactorily
  - §5:100.30.10 Employee Is Incumbent
  - §5:100.30.20 Conflicting Evidence of Qualifications in SSDI Applications
  - §5:100.30.30 Relevance of Performance to the *Prima Facie* Case, Employer's Reason, and Pretext
- §5:100.40 Adverse Employment Action: Defined
- §5:100.50 Employer Knowledge of Plaintiff's Age
- §5:100.60 Treatment of Younger Employees
  - §5:100.60.10 Similarly Situated Requirement
  - §5:100.60.20 Substantially Younger Comparator
- §5:100.70 Discharge Cases
  - §5:100.70.10 General
  - §5:100.70.20 Reductions in Force

**§5:110 Employer's Assertion of a Legitimate, Nondiscriminatory Reason**

**§5:120 Pretext**

- §5:120.10 False Reasons
  - §5:120.10.10 Employer's Honest or Mistaken Belief
- §5:120.20 Changing or Inconsistent Reasons
- §5:120.30 Using Statistical Evidence to Support Showing of Pretext

**C. Because of Age**

**§5:130 *Gross v. FBL* Disallows "Motivating Factor" Standard and Burden Shifting Analysis of *Price Waterhouse* or Title VII Section 703(m) in ADEA Cases**

- §5:130.10 A Determining Factor Establishes Liability
- §5:130.20 Multiple Claim Cases Are Not "Mixed Motive" Cases
- §5:130.30 Likely Legislative Response to *Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc.*
- §5:130.40 *Gross* Does Not Apply to Federal Employees' ADEA Claims

**§5:140 The Debate Over the Various Methods of Proving Disparate Treatment**

**D. Types of Evidence**

**§5:150 Ageist Comments vs. Stray Remarks**

- §5:150.10 Ageist Statements as Direct Evidence
  - §5:150.10.10 Comments About Retirement
- §5:150.20 Clarity and Content of the Statement
- §5:150.30 Content vs. Context of Ageist Statement
- §5:150.40 Statements by Decision-Makers
- §5:150.50 Standards for Subordinate Bias Liability (AKA "Cat's Paw" or "Rubber Stamp" Liability)
  - §5:150.50.10 Statements by Non-Decision-Makers
- §5:150.60 Ageist Statements Made to Others

**§5:160 Comparative Evidence**

**§5:170 Corporate Culture and Stereotyping Evidence**

§5:170.10 Circuit Analyses

§5:170.20 Unconscious or Hidden Discrimination

§5:170.30 Discovery of Culture and Stereotyping Evidence

§5:170.40 Statements Evidencing an Ageist Corporate Culture

**III. DISPARATE IMPACT**

**A. Introduction**

**§5:180 Overview**

**§5:190 *Smith v. City of Jackson* Holds ADEA Permits Impact Claims**

§5:190.10 Plurality Opinion in *Smith v. City of Jackson*

§5:190.20 Justice Scalia's Deference to EEOC's Regulations

§5:190.30 Justice O'Connor's Refusal to Recognize Disparate Impact Under the ADEA

**B. Applying Disparate Impact Analysis After *Smith v. City of Jackson***

**§5:200 Establishing a Disparate Impact Claim After *Smith v. City of Jackson* and *Meacham v. Knolls***

§5:200.10 Identify Particular Practice That Caused the Impact

§5:200.20 Statistically Demonstrate a Disproportionate Impact

**§5:210 The Reasonable Factor Other Than Age Defense to Disparate Impact Claims**

§5:210.10 Employer Must Plead RFOA as an Affirmative Defense

§5:210.20 Factor Cannot Be Related to Age

§5:210.30 Factor Must Be Job-Related to Be Reasonable

§5:210.40 *Wards Cove* Does Not Apply to ADEA Disparate Impact Defense

§5:210.50 Circuit Court's Application of *Smith v. City of Jackson*

**§5:220 Plaintiff's Rebuttal in Disparate Impact Cases**

**§5:230 New EEOC Rule on Defense to Disparate Impact Claims**

**C. Using Disparate Impact Model in Disparate Treatment Cases**

**§5:240 Discussion**

## **IV. STATISTICAL EVIDENCE**

### **§5:250 Disparate Treatment Cases**

§5:250.10 Age-Break Analysis in Disparate Impact Cases

§5:250.20 Non-Parametric Tests

§5:250.30 Regression Analysis

## **V. AGE PLUS THEORY OF INTERSECTIONAL DISCRIMINATION**

§5:260 Age Plus Another Protected Trait

## **VI. APPENDIX**

§5:270 Jury Instructions – Because of Age

## **CHAPTER 6. REMEDIES AVAILABLE UNDER ADEA**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

§6:10 Overview

### **II. AVAILABLE REMEDIES**

#### **A. Equitable Remedies**

§6:20 Preliminary Injunctions

§6:30 Permanent Injunctions

§6:30.10 Broad Injunctions

§6:30.20 Narrow Injunctions

§6:40 Reinstatement, Instatement, and Other Relief

§6:40.10 Reinstatement Appropriate

§6:40.20 Reinstatement Inappropriate

§6:40.30 Hearing

§6:50 Front Pay

§6:50.10 Determining Front Pay

§6:50.20 Number of Years Granted

§6:50.30 Offsets

§6:50.40 Calculations

§6:50.50 Decision by Judge or Jury

## **B. Legal Remedies**

### **§6:60 Backpay**

- §6:60.10 Determining Backpay
  - §6:60.10.10 Lost Raises
  - §6:60.10.20 Lost Pension Benefit Contributions
  - §6:60.10.30 Life Insurance Premiums
  - §6:60.10.40 Health Insurance
  - §6:60.10.50 Earnings From Other Sources
- §6:60.20 Income From Collateral Sources
- §6:60.30 Employee's Duty to Mitigate Damages
  - §6:60.30.10 Effect of Employer's Offer of Reinstatement
  - §6:60.30.20 Need For Absolute Offer of Reinstatement
  - §6:60.30.30 Employer's Burden to Show Unreasonable Rejection of Offer
  - §6:60.30.40 Employee's Duty to Conduct Job Search
  - §6:60.30.50 Employer's Burden to Show Unreasonable Job Search
  - §6:60.30.60 Voluntary Resignation
  - §6:60.30.70 Unavailability for Work
  - §6:60.30.80 Elimination of Plaintiff's Position

### **§6:70 Liquidated Damages**

- §6:70.10 Unavailable in Cases Against Federal Government or Agencies
  - §6:70.10.10 Available Against Municipalities/Public Agencies
- §6:70.20 Determining Double Damages
- §6:70.30 Determining "Willfulness"
- §6:70.40 Effect of Death of Plaintiff on Liquidated Damages

### **§6:80 Compensatory Damages**

### **§6:90 Punitive Damages**

### **§6:100 Interest**

### **§6:110 Costs**

- §6:110.10 Attorneys' Fees
  - §6:110.10.10 "Reasonable" Fees
  - §6:110.10.20 Calculation of Attorneys' Fees Award
  - §6:110.10.30 Right to Recover Attorneys' Fees. Award
  - §6:110.10.40 Recoverability of Time Spent in Administrative Proceedings
  - §6:110.10.50 Interest on Attorneys' Fees Award
  - §6:110.10.60 "Prevailing Party" for Purposes of Attorneys' Fees Award
  - §6:110.10.70 Discovery and Hearing
  - §6:110.10.80 Taxability of Attorneys' Fees Award
  - §6:110.10.90 Attorneys' Fees in ADEA Actions



## **CHAPTER 7. SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

**§7:10 The Battleground**

### **II. PROCEDURAL PRINCIPLES**

**§7:20 Summary Judgment Standards**

**§7:30 Governing Rules**

**§7:40 Timing of Motion for Summary Judgment**

**§7:50 Minimum Time and Notice for Plaintiff's Response**

**§7:60 Insist on Discovery Critical to Opposing Motion for Summary Judgment**

§7:60.10 File Rule 56(f) Motion or Affidavit Stating Why Discovery Is Needed

§7:60.10.10 Form: Rule 56(f) Motion Stating Why Discovery Is Needed

§7:60.20 Failure to Pursue Discovery Can Nullify Right to Seek Discovery Under Rule 56(f)

§7:60.30 Discovery Motions Are Not Responsive Pleadings to a Rule 56 Motion for Summary Judgment

**§7:70 Materials Supporting Opposition to Summary Judgment**

§7:70.10 Materials Must Be in Record

§7:70.10.10 Oppose Defendant's Statement of Uncontested Facts

§7:70.20 Materials Challenging Veracity of Defendant's Reasons

§7:70.30 Using or Challenging Summary Judgment Affidavits

§7:70.40 Base Affidavits on Personal Knowledge

§7:70.50 Avoid Affidavits That Are Conclusory, Purely Self-Serving, or Based on Generalizations

§7:70.60 Do Not Use Plaintiff's Affidavit to Patch Up His Deposition

§7:70.70 Form: Reply per Local Rule to Defendant's Statement of Undisputed Facts

**§7:80 Plaintiff Strategies**

### **III. METHODS OF PROOF AND SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

**§7:90 Overview of Methods of Proving Age Discrimination**

**§7:100 Plaintiff's Burden to Make *Prima Facie* Case**

§7:100.10 Establishing Qualifications or Satisfactory Performance

§7:100.20 Alleging an Adverse Employment Action

§7:100.30 Summary Judgment on the 4th Element of the *Prima Facie* Case

**§7:110 *Prima Facie* Analysis in RIF Cases**

§7:110.10 Form: Brief in Response to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment  
– *Prima Facie* Analysis in RIF Case

**§7:120 Alternative Methods of Establishing *Prima Facie* Case**

**IV. PRESENTING SUFFICIENT PRETEXT EVIDENCE**

**§7:130 Plaintiff's Objectives in Proving Pretext**

**§7:140 Pretext After *Reeves v. Sanderson Plumbing Products, Inc.***

§7:140.10 Form: Plaintiff's Memorandum in Opposition to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment

**§7:150 Challenging the Employer's Reasons**

§7:150.10 Cast Doubt From Ever-Changing Reasons

§7:150.20 Cast Doubt From "Bagful" of Reasons

§7:150.30 Challenging Subjective and Objective Reasons

§7:150.40 Do Not Allow Employer's "Business Judgment" To Be a Shield for Discrimination

§7:150.50 Employer's Honest Belief Is Not Pretext

§7:150.60 Rebutting Defendant's Cost Argument

§7:150.70 Challenging Implausible Reasons

§7:150.80 Inconsistent Application of Policies or Procedures

§7:150.90 Challenge Inferences Against Discrimination

§7:150.90.10 Same Bad Actor Theory

§7:150.90.10.10 Challenging Same Actor Inference

§7:150.90.20 Age of the Decision-Maker

**V. TYPES OF EVIDENCE**

**§7:160 Using Evidence of Discriminatory Comments to Withstand Summary Judgment**

§7:160.10 Ageist Comments Constituting Direct Evidence

§7:160.20 Statements by Decision-Makers

§7:160.30 Statements by Non-Decision-Makers

§7:160.40 Statements Evidencing an Ageist Corporate Culture

§7:160.50 Ageist Statements Made to Others

**§7:170 Disputed Qualifications as Evidence of Pretext**

§7:170.10 Superior Qualifications as Evidence of Pretext

§7:170.20 More-Than-Comparable Qualifications Are Needed to Demonstrate Pretext

**§7:180 Statistical Evidence**

## **VI. SUMMARY JUDGMENT FORMS**

**§7:190 Differential Treatment of Similarly Situated Employees**

**§7:200 Opposition Briefs**

§7:200.10 Form: Plaintiff's Memo in Opposition to Defendant's MSJ – RIF Case

§7:200.20 Form: Plaintiff's Memo in Opposition to Defendant's MSJ – RIF Case (II)

§7:200.30 Form: Plaintiff's Memo in Opposition to Defendant's MSJ – Direct Evidence

**§7:210 Form: Plaintiff's Appeal of Grant of Summary Judgment**

**§7:220 Form: Plaintiff/Appellant's Reply Brief on Appeal of Grant of Summary Judgment**

## **CHAPTER 8. HOW YOUR OPPONENT MAY TRY TO LIMIT YOUR EVIDENCE**

### **I. EXCLUDING EXPERT TESTIMONY: *DAUBERT***

**§8:10 Introduction**

**§8:20 *Daubert* Opinion**

**§8:30 *Daubert* and Age Discrimination**

§8:30.10 Statistics

§8:30.10.10 *Adams v. Ameritech Services, Inc.*

§8:30.10.20 Demographic/Census Data

§8:30.20 Stereotyping

### **II. EXCLUDING TESTIMONY OF AGE-RELATED STATEMENTS**

**§8:40 Introduction**

**§8:50 Cases in Which Remarks Were Excluded**

**§8:60 Cases in Which Remarks Were Admitted**

§8:60.10 Form: Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion to Exclude Evidence

**§8:70 Cases Where Motion in Limine to Exclude Age-Related Remarks Granted in Part, Denied in Part**

**§8:80 Cases Where Motions for Summary Judgment or Judgment N.O.V. Were Involved**

### **III. DAMAGES ISSUES**

§8:90 Bifurcation of Damages and Liability Phases

§8:100 Whether Front Pay Should Be Computed by Court or Jury

### **IV. OTHER MOTIONS IN LIMINE**

§8:110 Post-Termination Evidence

§8:110.10 Post-Firing Performance of Replacement Worker

§8:110.20 Hiring of Other Older Workers Post-Termination

§8:120 EEOC Letters of Violation and Probable Cause Statements

§8:130 Terminated Employee's Incompleted Training

§8:140 Employee's Reputation

§8:150 Treatment of Non-Similarly Situated Employees

§8:160 Financial Earnings of Defendant After Reduction in Force

§8:170 Disparate Impact

§8:180 After-Acquired Evidence

§8:190 Plaintiff's Failure to Make Offer of Proof

## **CHAPTER 9. USING EXPERTS IN AGE DISCRIMINATION CASES**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

§9:10 Overview

### **II. CHOOSING EXPERTS AND AREAS OF EXPERTISE**

§9:20 Areas of Expert Testimony In Age Discrimination Cases

§9:20.10 Statistical

§9:20.20 Age Stereotyping

§9:20.30 Emotional Distress

§9:20.40 Employment Practices

§9:20.50 Damages

§9:20.60 Business Practices

**§9:30 Finding and Selecting Experts**

**§9:40 Lawyers' Role in Preparing Experts**

### **III. EXPERT DEPOSITIONS**

**§9:50 Introduction**

§9:50.10 Reasons to Depose Expert

§9:50.20 Reasons Not to Depose Expert

**§9:60 Goals for Expert Deposition**

**§9:70 Preparing for Deposition**

**§9:80 Areas for Examination**

**§9:90 [Reserved]**

### **IV. EXPERTS AT TRIAL**

**§9:100 Examining Expert Who Was Not Deposed**

§9:100.10 Introduction

§9:100.10.10 Benefits of “Blind” Examination

§9:100.10.20 Case Example

§9:100.20 Defense Expert's Objectives

§9:100.20.10 The “Bought Expert”

§9:100.20.20 The Expert Who Is Challenged as Being “Affiliated” With the Side That Hired Him

§9:100.20.30 Client Considerations

§9:100.20.40 Control the Witness Example: Examiner Effects

§9:100.20.50 Avoid Historic Hysterical Gambits Unless You Are Sure You Can Pull it Off

§9:100.20.60 The Language of Expert Testimony

§9:100.30 Real Life Examples

§9:100.30.10 The Defense Expert in the *Mars* Case

§9:100.30.20 Example 2: Defendant's Expert in State Court

**§9:110 *In Limine* Hearings**

**§9:120 Voir Dire**

**§9:130 Experts' Use of Demonstrative Evidence**

**§9:140 Consultative Experts at Trial**

**§9:150 Elements of Persuasive Expert Witness Testimony**

## **V. LEGAL ISSUES**

### **§9:160 “Gatekeeper” Function**

§9:160.10 *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*

§9:160.20 *General Electric Co. v. Joiner*

§9:160.30 *Kumho Tire Co. v. Carmichael*

§9:160.40 Rule 702 Supersedes *Daubert*

§9:160.41 Improper Extrapolation

§9:160.42 Reliance on Anecdotal Evidence

§9:160.43 Reliance on Temporal Proximity

§9:160.44 Insufficient Connection Between Expert’s Opinion and Case

§9:160.45 Failure to Consider Other Possible Causes

§9:160.46 Lack of Testing

§9:160.47 Subjectivity

§9:160.50 Defending and Attacking Expert Witnesses Under New Rules

§9:160.51 Plaintiff’s Motion *in Limine* to Exclude Expert Testimony

§9:160.52 Plaintiff’s Reply in Support of Plaintiff’s Motion in *Limine* to Determine Admissibility of Expert Testimony and Response to Cross-Motion on Same Issue

### **§9:170 Expert Report**

§9:170.10 Who Must Provide Report?

§9:170.20 Scope of Report

§9:170.30 Discoverability of Expert and Attorney Work-Product

§9:170.40 Rebuttal Experts

§9:170.50 Supplemental Reports

### **§9:180 Issues Regarding Particular Kinds of Experts**

§9:180.10 Treating Physicians as Experts

§9:180.20 Statisticians as Experts

§9:180.30 Vocational Experts

§9:180.40 Actuaries, Economists and Other Experts

### **§9:190 Fees**

§9:190.10 Responding to Discovery

§9:190.20 Lodging and Travel

## **CHAPTER 10. TRIAL**

### **I. STRATEGIES**

#### **§10:10 Introduction**

#### **§10:20 Motions *in Limine***

§10:20.10 Defendant’s Objectives

§10:20.20 Plaintiff’s Objectives

§10:20.30 Factors Weighed in Grant or Denial

- §10:20.35 Rule 101 Issues
- §10:20.40 Rule 403 Exclusions
- §10:20.50 Rule 404 Exclusions
- §10:20.60 Rule 408 Exclusions
- §10:20.70 Lay Witness Opinion Testimony
- §10:20.80 Other Acts of Discrimination
- §10:20.90 Other Ground for Motions *in Limine*
- §10:20.100 Forms
- §10:20.110 Form: Defendant’s Motion *in Limine* – Reduction in Force – Age/Race Discrimination
- §10:20.120 Form: Plaintiff’s Motion to Exclude Manager’s Testimony About What Plaintiff’s Coworkers Said
- §10:20.130 Form: Plaintiff’s Reply to Defendant’s Motion to Exclude Evidence of Promotions of Younger, Similarly Situated Workers

**§10:30 Using Expert Witnesses**

- §10:30.10 *Daubert* Standards
- §10:30.20 Plaintiff’s Expert Witnesses
- §10:30.30 Defendant’s Expert Witnesses
- §10:30.40 Avoiding Expert Witness Challenges Before Trial
- §10:30.50 Using Expert Testimony on Statistics
  - §10:30.50.10 “Employee Flow” Information
  - §10:30.50.20 Small Sample Size
  - §10:30.50.30 Age Groupings and Manipulation of Statistics

**II. PROVING DAMAGES**

**§10:40 ADEA Damages Limits; Pendant State Claims**

**§10:50 Evaluating Damages**

- §10:50.10 Backpay
- §10:50.20 Liquidated Damages
- §10:50.30 Client’s Rejection of Reinstatement Offers
- §10:50.40 Pension Benefits – No Offset
- §10:50.50 Client’s Actions Stopping Backpay Accrual
- §10:50.60 Tax Considerations

**§10:60 Proving Backpay**

- §10:60.10 “Same Decision” Defense
- §10:60.20 After-Acquired Evidence Defense
- §10:60.30 Calculating Claim
- §10:60.40 Limitation Periods
- §10:60.50 Overtime Pay Included
- §10:60.60 Pension or Savings Plans
- §10:60.70 Health Insurance Costs
- §10:60.80 Setoffs

**§10:70 Proof Issues Concerning Reinstatement**

§10:70.10 Hostility

**§10:80 Proving Front Pay**

§10:80.10 Determination by Judge or Jury

**§10:90 Proving Willfulness**

§10:90.10 Direct Evidence

§10:90.20 Circumstantial Evidence

**III. JURIES**

**§10:100 Mock Juries**

**§10:110 Juror Questionnaires**

**§10:120 Dealing With Juror Biases**

**§10:130 Form: Plaintiff's Proposed Voir Dire**

**§10:131 Overturning Jury Verdicts**

**IV. JURY INSTRUCTIONS**

**A. Age Discrimination**

**§10:140 Form: Overview**

**§10:150 Form: Statutory Language**

**§10:160 Form: Essential Elements of Plaintiff's Claim**

§10:160.10 Jury Instructions on the *McDonnell Douglas* Framework

**§10:161 Form: ADEA – Disparate Treatment – Essential Elements (Mixed Motive)**

**§10:162 Form: Element and Damage Instructions**

**§10:170 Form: “Intentional Discrimination” – Definition and Proof**

**§10:180 Form: Proof of Plaintiff's Age Discrimination Claims**

**§10:181 Form: Burden of Proof – ADEA Cases**

**§10:182 Form: Burden of Proof – ADEA Cases – Alternate**

**§10:183 Form: Direct Evidence of Age Discrimination**



**§10:184 Form: Proof of Intent**

**§10:185 Form: Proof of Adequate Performance**

**§10:190 Form: Decisions Made for Reasonable Factors Other Than Age –  
Defendant Instruction**

**§10:200 Form: Subjective Judgments – Defendant Instruction**

**§10:210 Form: Actions Not Prohibited – Defendant Instruction**

**§10:220 Form: Alleged Unfair Treatment – Defendant Instruction**

**§10:230 Form: Less Favorable Treatment Than Non-Protected Individuals**

**§10:240 Form: Pretext**  
    §10:240.10 Failure to Instruct Jury on Pretext

**§10:241 Form: “Pretext” Defined**

**§10:242 Form: Proof of Pretext**

**§10:250 Form: Method of Proving Pretext**

**§10:260 Form: Interrogatory – Pretext Case**

**§10:270 Form: Motivating Factor**

**§10:271 Form: Determining Factor**

**§10:280 Form: Willfulness**

**§10:281 Form: ADEA – Disparate Treatment – Willfulness – Eighth Circuit**

**B. Special Interrogatories**

**§10:290 Form: Adverse Employment Action**

**§10:300 Form: Causal Link Between Age and Adverse Employment Action**

**§10:310 Form: Performance Evaluation**

**§10:320 Form: Termination No. 1**

**§10:330 Form: Termination No. 2**

**§10:340 Form: Termination No. 3**

### **C. Retaliation**

- §10:350 Form: *Prima Facie* Case
- §10:360 Form: “Retaliation” – Definition
- §10:370 Form: Essential Elements
- §10:380 Form: Essential Elements – Alternate
- §10:390 Form: Plaintiff’s Burden
- §10:400 Form: Evidence To Consider
- §10:410 Form: Pattern or Practice – Retaliation
- §10:420 Form: Determinative Factor

### **1. DAMAGES**

- §10:430 Form: Overview
- §10:440 Form: Backpay
- §10:450 Form: Backpay – Prevented from Returning to Work on Light Duty
- §10:460 Form: Retaliation – Willfulness – Discussion

### **2. SPECIAL INTERROGATORIES – RETALIATION**

- §10:470 Form: Interrogatory – Retaliation
- §10:480 Form: Retaliation Via Low Performance Evaluation
- §10:490 Form: Retaliation Via Particular Assignment
- §10:500 Form: Retaliation – Refusal to Buy Back Unused Vacation Days
- §10:510 Form: Retaliation – Refusal to Allow Plaintiff to Return to Work on Light Duty

### **D. Harassment**

- §10:520 Form: Tangible Employment Action

- §10:530 Form: Liability When Tangible Employment Action Taken
- §10:540 Form: Liability When Tangible Employment Action Taken – Short Form
- §10:550 Form: Liability When No Tangible Employment Action Taken
- §10:560 Form: “Supervisor” – Definition
- §10:570 Form: “Supervisory Status” – Definition
- §10:580 Form: Vicarious Liability for Harassment
- §10:590 Form: Harassment – Acquiescence and Adverse Action

### **E. Damages**

- §10:600 Form: Overview
- §10:601 Form: ADEA – Disparate Treatment – Actual Damages
- §10:610 Form: Mitigation of Damages
- §10:620 Form: Liquidated Damages – Overview
- §10:630 Form: Willfulness Damages – Factors, Short Form
- §10:640 Form: Willfulness Damages – Factors, Long Form
- §10:641 Form: Tax Liability – Grossing Up

### **F. Verdict Forms**

- §10:650 Form: General Verdict
- §10:651 Form: Disparate Treatment
- §10:660 Form: Finding for Plaintiff – Willfulness
- §10:670 Form: Finding for Plaintiff
- §10:680 Form: Finding for Defendant

### **V. MISCELLANEOUS FORMS**

- §10:690 Form: Complaint – Age Discrimination – Retaliation

**§10:691 Form: Complaint – Age Discrimination – Termination – Title VII – ADEA – OWBPA – Breach of Severance Agreement**

**§10:692 Form: Demand for Jury Trial to Set Aside Arbitration Award**

**§10:700 Form: Plaintiff’s Rule 50 Motion for Pre-Verdict Judgment as a Matter of Law**

**§10:710 Form: Plaintiff’s Brief in Response and Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for a New Trial, Judgment Notwithstanding the Verdict or Relief From Judgment**

**§10:720 Form: EEOC Brief in Support of Petition for Rehearing *En Banc***

**§10:721 Form: Plaintiff’s Motion to Strike Affirmative Defenses**

## **CHAPTER 11. REPRESENTING MULTIPLE PLAINTIFFS**

### **I. REPRESENTING MULTIPLE PLAINTIFFS**

#### **§11:10 Introduction (*Wal-Mart Stores v. Dukes*)**

§11:10.10 Background

§11:10.20 Commonality Requirement for Class Certification Becomes More Demanding

§11:10.30 Rule 23(b)(2) Does Not Permit Class With Members Requesting Individual Relief

§11:10.40 *Dukes* Strengthens Defendants’ Hands in Class Actions

§11:10.50 Impact of the Decision

#### **§11:20 Advantages and Disadvantages of Multiple Representation**

§11:20.10 Advantages

§11:20.20 Disadvantages

§11:20.30 Limiting Representation to Administrative Stage

§11:20.40 Financing a Class Action

§11:20.50 Associating With Co-Counsel

#### **§11:30 Identifying Potential Plaintiffs**

§11:30.10 Consider the Impact of Releases

§11:30.20 OWBPA Eligible and Ineligible Employee List

§11:30.30 OWBPA as Tool to Challenge Releases

#### **§11:40 Cases Combining ADEA and Other Claims**

## **II. ADEA STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS FOR REPRESENTATIVE OR COLLECTIVE ACTIONS**

- §11:50 Governing Statutory Provisions**
  - §11:50.10 Statute of Limitations Issues
  - §11:50.20 How the Time Period Is Calculated
  - §11:50.30 Tolling of Time
  
- §11:60 [Reserved]**

## **III. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS**

- §11:70 Introduction**
  
- §11:80 Contents of Charge**
  - §11:80.10 Class-Wide Claims
  
- §11:90 Who Should File EEOC Charge?**
  - §11:90.10 Named Plaintiffs
  - §11:90.20 Opt-In Plaintiffs: Single Filing Rule
    - §11:90.20.10 Opt-In's Claim Must Fall Within Time Period
    - §11:90.20.20 Charge Must Give Notice of Potential Class Claims
  
- §11:100 Effect of EEOC Treatment of Charge**

## **IV. COMPLAINT**

- §11:110 Designating Named Plaintiffs**
  
- §11:120 Defining the Class**
  
- §11:130 Statute of Limitations**
  - §11:130.10 Named Plaintiffs
  - §11:130.20 Opt-In Plaintiffs
  - §11:130.30 Denial of Certification or Decertification

## **V. DEALING WITH COMPANION LITIGATION BY EEOC**

- §11:140 Introduction**
  
- §11:150 Working With EEOC to Avoid Cutting Off Opt-Ins' Rights**
  
- §11:160 Discovery Expenses**
  
- §11:170 Attorney's Fees**

## **VI. NOTICE AND OPT-IN PROCEDURE**

§11:180 Introduction

§11:190 Court-Approved Notice

§11:200 Authorization/”Conditional Certification” of Class for Notice

§11:210 Obtaining Names and Addresses for Notice

§11:220 Contents of Notice

§11:230 Contents of Consent Form

## **VII. AUTHORIZATION OF REPRESENTATIVE ACTION OR “CERTIFICATION” OF CLASS**

§11:240 Introduction

§11:250 Test for Determining Whether Class Members Are Similarly Situated

§11:250.10 Centralization of the Defendant’s Activities

§11:250.20 Similarities of the Potential Plaintiffs

§11:250.30 Common Claims and Defenses

§11:260 Dealing With the Decertification of an ADEA Collective Action

## **VIII. DISCOVERY IN ADEA REPRESENTATIVE OR COLLECTIVE ACTIONS**

§11:270 Discovery of Plaintiffs

§11:270.10 Named Plaintiffs

§11:270.20 Opt-In Plaintiffs

§11:270.30 Individual Damages

§11:280 Discovery of Defendants

§11:280.10 Electronic Information

§11:280.20 Consultants Used to Design a Reduction-in-Force or Work Force  
Restructuring

## **IX. PROVING DISCRIMINATION IN AN ADEA CLASS ACTION**

§11:290 Theories of Proof

§11:290.10 Disparate Treatment – Pattern and Practice Claims

§11:290.20 Disparate Impact

**§11:300 Statistical Evidence**

- §11:300.10 Controlling for the Employment Practice
- §11:300.20 Representative Sample
- §11:300.30 Adequate Sample Size
- §11:300.40 Sufficient Disparity
- §11:300.50 Bolster Statistics with Other Evidence

**§11:310 Resources on Class Actions**

**X. FORMS**

**§11:320 Impact Fund Application Form**

**§11:330 Notice to Potential Class Members**

**§11:340 Consent Form**

**§11:350 Memorandum to Certify a Collective Action**

**§11:360 Order Granting Notice, Notice & Consent Form**

**CHAPTER 12. SETTLEMENTS**

**I. OVERVIEW**

**§12:10 Introduction**

**II. SETTLEMENTS UNDER CIVIL RIGHTS STATUTES GENERALLY**

**§12:20 Waivers Must be “Knowing and Voluntary”**

- §12:20.10 Test: “Ordinary Contract Principles”
- §12:20.20 Test: “Totality of Circumstances”
- §12:20.30 Releases Executed by Unrepresented Claimants Before Litigation
- §12:20.40 Admissibility of Release and Settlement Agreements at Trial

**§12:30 Prospective Waivers – Invalid**

**§12:40 Class Action Settlements – Who is Covered?**

**§12:50 Waivers Prohibiting Cooperation With Other Employees Who Have Charges**

**III. SETTLEMENTS UNDER ADEA**

**§12:60 OWBPA – Regulations, Generally**

- §12:60.10 “Voluntary” Participation in Exit Program
- §12:60.20 Cost Justifications for Differing Employee Benefits

- §12:60.30 Severance and Disability Offsets
- §12:60.40 EEOC Requirements for “Knowing and Voluntary” Waiver
- §12:60.50 OWBPA Requirements for “Knowing and Voluntary” Waiver
  - §12:60.50.10 Must Be in Plain Language
  - §12:60.50.20 Must Refer to ADEA by Name
  - §12:60.50.30 Must Not Waive Future Rights
  - §12:60.50.40 Employee Must Receive Compensation in Addition to Anything to Which Already Entitled
  - §12:60.50.50 Consideration Does Not Mean Reinstating a Wrongfully Terminated Employee Benefit
  - §12:60.50.60 No Additional Consideration Requirement for Employees Over 40 if Terminated Pursuant to Program or Plan
  - §12:60.50.70 21/45 Days to Sign – Period Can be Waived
  - §12:60.50.80 Employee Must be Advised in Writing of Opportunity to Revoke Release Within Seven Days of Signing
  - §12:60.50.90 What Constitutes “Exit Incentive Program” or “Plan”?
  - §12:60.50.100 Broader Definition of “Decision-Making Unit”
  - §12:60.50.110 Waivers/Releases Cannot Effect EEOC Enforcement

**§12:70 Tender Back Rules**

- §12:70.10 Tender Back Rules Before *Oubre*
- §12:70.20 Tender Back After *Oubre*
  - §12:70.20.10 EEOC Regulations Following *Oubre*
  - §12:70.20.20 What Constitutes Knowing and Voluntary Release Under Proposed Regulation?
  - §12:70.20.30 Covenants Not To Challenge Release Are Invalid

**IV. WHAT TO LOOK FOR IN SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS**

**§12:80 Type and Scope of Release**

**§12:90 Entitlement to Benefits**

**§12:100 References**

**§12:110 Tax Aspects of Settlement**

- §12:110.10 IRS Audit Considerations
- §12:110.20 Case Law

**§12:120 Form: Separation and Release Agreement – Termination**

- §12:120.10 Form: Annotated Settlement Agreement
- §12:120.20 Form: Separation and Release Agreement – Short Form

**§12:130 Form: Confidential Settlement and General Release Agreement – State Human Rights Claim**



§12:140 **Form: Settlement Agreement and General Release – Employment Contract – Termination – Nondisclosure**

§12:150 **Form: Consent Decree – Reductions in Force**

## **V. MEDIATION**

§12:160 **Form: Plaintiff’s Confidential Mediation Brief**

## **CHAPTER 13. AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYEE BENEFITS**

### **I. OVERVIEW**

§13:10 **Introduction**

§13:20 **Background**

§13:20.10 **Benefit Plans**

§13:20.20 **Involuntary Retirement Prior to Age 70 Pursuant to Bona Fide Employee Benefit Plan**

§13:20.30 **Effect on Employee Benefit Plan**

§13:20.30.10 **General Principles**

§13:20.30.20 **Application to Particular Types of Plans**

§13:20.30.30 **Health Insurance**

§13:20.30.40 **Long-Term Disability Plans**

§13:20.30.50 **Retirement Plans**

### **II. EQUAL BENEFIT OR EQUAL COST STANDARD OF PROOF**

§13:30 ***Prima Facie* Case: Unequal Benefits**

§13:30.10 **Facially Discriminatory Plans State a Claim of Disparate Treatment**

§13:30.10.10 **Special Cases Involving Pension Status**

§13:30.20 **Evidence of Age-Based Motive or Animus Not Required**

§13:30.30 ***Hazen Paper* “Age-Proxy” Analysis Does Not Apply to Facially Discriminatory Benefit Plans**

§13:40 **Equal Cost Affirmative Defense**

### **III. EARLY RETIREMENT BENEFITS**

§13:50 **Introduction**

§13:60 **Minimum Eligibility Ages are Permissible**

**§13:70 Affirmative Defense: ERI Is Voluntary and Consistent With ADEA Purpose**

§13:70.10 Employer's Burden in Establishing ERI Defense

§13:70.20 Voluntariness

§13:70.30 Consistent With Purposes of ADEA

§13:70.30.10 Plans With Upper Age Limit on Eligibility

§13:70.30.20 Permissible Early Retirement Incentive Plans

**IV. PENSION BENEFITS**

**§13:80 Social Security Bridge Payments**

**§13:90 Pension Subsidies**

**§13:100 Age-Based Exclusions From Pension Plans**

§13:100.10 Under ADEA and OWBPA

§13:100.20 Under ERISA as Amended by Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act of 1986

**§13:110 Pension Credits and Accruals**

§13:110.10 Conversions to Cash Balance Plans

**§13:120 Pensions and Age 70 1/2 Payout Rule**

**V. SEVERANCE BENEFITS UNDER OWBPA**

**§13:130 Severance Benefits May Not Be Denied or Reduced Based on Pension Eligibility**

**§13:140 Severance Offset of Retiree Health or Pension Enhancements**

**VI. DISABILITY BENEFITS**

**§13:150 Overview**

**VII. HEALTH BENEFITS**

**§13:160 Overview**

§13:160.10 EEOC Policy

**VIII. PROCEDURAL ISSUES IN DISCRIMINATORY BENEFITS PLANS**

**§13:170 Timeliness**

§13:180 Ripeness and Standing

§13:190 Standing of Retirees

§13:200 Pre-OWBPA Series of Benefit Payments

§13:210 Whom to Name as Defendant in Benefits Suit?

## **IX. ERISA**

§13:220 Overview

§13:230 Scope of ERISA § 510 – Discharge, Discrimination, Interference and Retaliation

§13:240 Class Actions

§13:245 Qualified Retirement Plans

§13:250 Proving ERISA § 510 Claims

§13:260 Procedural Issues in ERISA § 510 Claims

§13:260.10 Standing

§13:260.20 Exhaustion Requirement

§13:260.30 Statute of Limitations

§13:260.40 Jury Trial

§13:260.50 *Res Judicata*

§13:260.60 Preemption of Wrongful Discharge Action

## **CHAPTER 14. WORK FORCE RESTRUCTURING, DOWNSIZING, AND REDUCTIONS IN FORCE**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

§14:10 Overview

§14:20 Scope

### **II. DETERMINE WHETHER FACTS PRESENT RIF CASE**

§14:30 Reduction in Force Defined

§14:31 RIFs Under the ADEA

§14:31.10 Generally

§14:31.20 Conduct Prohibited by the ADEA

- §14:31.30 ADEA Standards in RIF Cases
  - §14:31.30.10 Direct Evidence of Age Discrimination
  - §14:31.30.20 Indirect Evidence of Age Discrimination: Disparate Treatment
  - §14:31.30.30 RIF *Prima Facie* Case: Disparate Treatment
  - §14:31.30.40 Proof of Discriminatory Intent/Pretext: Disparate Treatment
  - §14:31.30.50 Mixed Motives
  - §14:31.30.60 Indirect Evidence of Age Discrimination: Disparate Impact
  - §14:31.30.70 Wage Discrimination

**§14:40 Plaintiff Strategy**

**III. IDENTIFY CLAIMS TO RAISE**

**§14:50 Termination, Failure to Hire or Transfer**

**§14:60 Constructive Discharge**

**§14:70 ERISA §510**

**IV. EXAMINE RIF PROCESS FOR DISCRIMINATION EVIDENCE**

**§14:80 Overview**

**§14:90 Consider Employer's Use of Subjective Criteria in Selection**

**§14:100 Use OWBPA to Obtain Age Data and Other Information**

- §14:100.10 What "Program" Triggers Information Disclosure?
  - §14:100.10.10 "Group" Programs
  - §14:100.10.20 Standardized Benefits Package
  - §14:100.10.30 Disclosure Applies to Involuntary and Voluntary Programs
- §14:100.20 Information to Be Disclosed
  - §14:100.20.10 Ages of All Employees
  - §14:100.20.20 Job Titles
  - §14:100.20.30 Same Job Classification or Organizational Unit
- §14:100.30 Using OWBPA Data

**§14:110 Determine if Employees' Ages Were Included in Termination Materials**

**§14:120 Consult Human Resource Literature about RIF Standards and Processes**

**V. FILE TIMELY CHARGE OF DISCRIMINATION**

**§14:130 Overview**

**§14:140 Determine Starting Date for Running of Charge Filing Period**

## **VI. PROVING AGE DISCRIMINATION IN A RIF**

### **§14:150 Overview**

§14:150.10 Disparate Impact Claims in RIF Cases

### **§14:160 *Prima Facie* Case**

§14:160.10 Plaintiff Performing According to Employer's Expectations

§14:160.20 Varying Formulations for the Fourth Element of *Prima Facie* Case

§14:160.20.10 Comparing Treatment of Older and Younger Employees

§14:160.20.20 "Additional" Evidence That Age Was a Factor

§14:160.20.30 "Substantially Younger" Employee?

§14:160.20.40 "Similarly Situated" Employees?

§14:160.20.50 Examining Who Was Retained

§14:160.30 Facts Applicable to Fourth Element of *Prima Facie* Case

§14:160.30.10 When Younger Employee Assumes Plaintiff's Duties

§14:160.30.20 Opportunity to Transfer

§14:160.40 Consider All Evidence Relevant to RIF

§14:160.40.10 Transfers Precipitating Layoffs

§14:160.40.20 Evidence About Potential Retirement

## **VII. EMPLOYER'S BURDEN OF PRODUCTION**

### **§14:170 RIF and its Criteria are Nondiscriminatory**

### **§14:180 Defendant's Business Judgment**

## **VIII. PROVING PRETEXT IN RIF CASES**

### **§14:190 Pretext**

§14:190.10 Inconsistent Application of RIF Criteria or RIF Process

§14:190.20 Evidence That RIF Is Pretextual

§14:190.20.10 Hirings

§14:190.20.10a Pre-RIF Hirings

§14:190.20.10b Post-RIF Hiring

§14:190.20.20 Transfers After or in Place of RIF

§14:190.20.30 Dangers of Attacking Economic Necessity of RIF

§14:190.30 Inconsistent Reasons for Plaintiff's Treatment by Employer

§14:190.40 Casting Doubt on Employer's Reasons

§14:190.50 Attacking Defendant's "RIF Expert"

§14:190.50.10 Form: Motion *in Limine* to Exclude Defendant's RIF Expert

§14:190.60 Qualifications Evidence/Performance Evaluations

### **§14:200 Use Statistical Evidence to Prove Age Discrimination**

§14:200.10 Qualities That Make Statistical Evidence Relevant and Meaningful

§14:200.10.10 Adequate Sample Size

§14:200.10.20 Comparison of Similarly Situated Employees

- §14:200.20 Using Statistics to Demonstrate Pretext
- §14:200.30 Using Age Data Separate From Statistical Presentation

**§14:210 Use Ageist Comments to Show Pretext**

- §14:210.10 Statements by Decisionmakers
- §14:210.20 Statements by Non-Decisionmakers
- §14:210.30 Statements Evidencing Ageist Corporate Culture
- §14:210.40 Does Comment Reflect Ageist Animus?

**§14:220 Attack “Same Actor” Defense Argument for an Inference of No Discrimination**

**IX. REVIEW AVAILABLE REMEDIES**

**§14:230 Overview**

**§14:240 Remedies at Trial**

- §14:240.10 Reinstatement
- §14:240.20 Front Pay
- §14:240.30 Liquidated Damages

**§14:250 Remedies Pursuant to Consent Decree**

**X. APPENDIX**

**§14:260 Model Reduction-in-Force Process**

**XI. FORM**

**§14:270 Plaintiff’s Response to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment in a RIF Case**

**CHAPTER 15. ATTORNEY’S FEES AND COSTS**

**I. INTRODUCTION**

**§15:10 Statutory Authority**

- §15:10.10 Statutory Background
- §15:10.20 General Overview
- §15:10.30 Upward Adjustment
- §15:10.40 Representation Agreement

**§15:20 Purpose of Fee-Shifting Statutes**

## **II. PARTIES ENTITLED TO FEES UNDER ADEA**

### **A. Parties Who May Recover Fees**

§15:30 “Prevailing” Plaintiffs

§15:40 Attorneys in Public Interest Organizations and Unions

§15:50 Federal Employees as ADEA Plaintiffs

### **B. Parties Who May Not Recover Fees**

§15:60 Defendants

§15:60.10 Defendants Cannot Recover Fees Under ADEA

§15:60.20 Defendants May be Able to Recover Under the American Rule

§15:60.20.10 Standard for Bad Faith

§15:60.20.20 Specific Findings by Court

§15:60.20.30 Plaintiff’s Opposition to a Defendant’s Fee Petition

§15:60.30 Defendants May Also Seek Fees Under FRCP 38

§15:70 EEOC

§15:80 Attorneys as ADEA Plaintiffs

§15:90 Summary

## **III. CALCULATING FEES**

§15:100 *Johnson v. Georgia Highway Express*

§15:110 Lodestar Method

## **IV. DETERMINING REASONABLE HOURLY RATES**

### **A. Prevailing Market Rate**

§15:120 Attorney’s Billing Rate

§15:130 Recent Awards

§15:140 Affidavits of Attorneys Regarding Community Billing Rate

§15:150 Defense Counsel’s Rates

**§15:160 Court's Establishment of Rate When Documentation Inadequate**

§15:160.10 Skill, Experience, and Reputation of Counsel

§15:160.20 Complexity of Case

**B. Factors in Determining Appropriate Rate**

§15:170 Actual versus Market Rates

§15:180 Flat versus Variable Rates

§15:190 Current versus Historical Rates

**C. Establishing Relevant Community**

§15:200 Introduction

§15:210 Forum Approach

§15:220 Out-of-Town Rates

§15:220.10 The Laffey Matrix Method

**V. COMPENSABLE ACTIVITIES**

**A. Representation Prior to Litigation**

§15:230 Administrative Proceedings

§15:240 Arbitration Proceedings

**B. Compensable Activities During Litigation**

§15:250 Organizing Files

§15:260 Conducting Mock Trial

§15:270 Fees Incurred After a Rule 68 Offer of Judgment Has Been Made

§15:280 Post-Trial Motions

§15:280.10 Enforcement Actions

§15:290 Litigating Fees

§15:300 Appellate Time

§15:310 Support Personnel

§15:320 Out-of-Pocket Expenses



**C. Non-Compensable Activities**

§15:330 Media or Public Relations Work

§15:340 Expert Fees Are Not Recoverable Under ADEA

**VI. REASONABLENESS OF HOURS EXPENDED**

§15:350 Introduction

§15:360 Billing Judgment

§15:360.10 Reasonably Staffing Case

§15:360.20 Avoid Duplicative Attorney Efforts

§15:360.30 Comparing Adversary's Hours and Conduct

**VII. RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DAMAGES AWARDED AND FEES SOUGHT**

§15:370 No Ceiling on Amount of Fees To be Recovered

§15:380 Entitlement to Higher of Contingent Fee or Court-Awarded Fee

§15:390 Relationship of Settlement Proposal to Damages Award

**VIII. ADJUSTMENTS TO LODESTAR**

**A. Overview**

§15:400 Introduction

**B. Upward Adjustments**

§15:410 Introduction

§15:420 Enhancements for Delays in Payment

§15:430 Enhancements for Exceptional Success

§15:440 Impermissible Adjustments

§15:450 Contingent Fee Cases

**C. Downward Adjustments**

§15:460 Introduction

§15:470 Unsuccessful Unrelated Claims

§15:480 Unsuccessful Related Claims

§15:480.10 Common Core of Facts

§15:480.20 Related Legal Theories

§15:490 Inappropriate Bases for Adjusting the Lodestar Downward

**D. Significance of Overall Relief Obtained**

§15:500 Excellent Results

§15:510 Partial or Limited Success

§15:520 Nominal Damages or *De Minimis* Recovery

**IX. COSTS**

**A. Recoverable Costs**

§15:530 Costs Under ADEA

**B. Rule 54(d) Costs**

§15:540 Introduction

§15:550 Transcripts

§15:560 Copies

§15:570 Expert Witness Fees

§15:580 Costs Not Recoverable

§15:590 Costs to Prevailing Defendant

**X. INTEREST ON FEE AWARD**

§15:600 Introduction

**XI. TAXATION OF ATTORNEY'S FEES**

§15:610 Introduction

**XII. GUIDELINES FOR SEEKING AND RECOVERING FEES**

**A. Establishing Basis for Fees Throughout Litigation**

§15:620 Introduction

§15:630 Covering Fee Issues in Retainer Agreement

§15:640 Keeping Contemporaneous Time Records

§15:650 Structuring and Conducting the Case With Fees and Costs in Mind

§15:650.10 Deciding Which Claims to Pursue

§15:650.20 Dealing With Defense Counsel

§15:650.30 Dealing With Court

§15:650.40 Billing Judgment

**B. Filing Your Petition For Fees**

§15:660 When to File

§15:670 Counsel's Burden to Establish Hourly Rate

§15:680 Petitioning Counsel's Affidavit

§15:690 Motion Requesting Attorney's Fees

§15:700 Fee Petition

§15:710 Supplemental Fee Requests

**C. Appealing Fee Issues**

§15:720 Introduction

**XIII. PRESERVING FEES WHEN EEOC IS INVOLVED IN LITIGATION**

§15:730 Introduction

**XIV. CHECKLIST FOR FEE PETITION**

§15:740 Checklist

**XV. FORMS**

§15:750 Affidavit of Lead Counsel

§15:760 Affidavits of Supporting Counsel

§15:770 Affidavit of Plaintiff

§15:780 Memorandum in Support of Attorney's Fees and Costs

§15:790 Memorandum in Opposition To Defendant's Petition for Fees and Costs

**APPENDIX A**

NELA Amicus Brief, *Smith v. City of Jackson*

**APPENDIX B**

NELA, AARP Amicus Brief — *Meacham v. Knolls Atomic Power Laboratory*.

**APPENDIX C**

“Top Ten” Tips to Make Your Case More Summary Judgment Resistant

**TABLE OF CASES**

**INDEX**